# te ara



## JOURNAL of museums aotearoa

### Digital Master Prints from imagelab













#### New Zealand's only large format Durst Lambda printer

Demanded by museums, exhibition managers, artists and photographers worldwide, Digital Master Prints are laser imaged direct onto photographic material up to 127cm wide by any continuous length. The ultimate in quality for photographs, illustrations and text.

Small images to large murals, Digital Master Prints give you:

- Clear, crisp and precise detail
- True, pure and brilliant colour
- Continuous tone no dots, no screens
- Total accuracy and consistency



Imagelab offers you the total range of imaging options for leading edge photographic and computer services, with an experienced team to help you.

We're used by leading photographers, display and design companies, museums, advertising agencies

and corporates throughout New Zealand - and we'll give you consistent quality that you can depend on.



#### SCANNING

From web to high res, Imagelab can scan your film or reflection originals. High end Durst, Imacon, Phase One and Kodak scanners ensure the very best results for even better graphics.

DIGITAL RETOUCH AND LAYOUT Your designers can send us print ready files or our experienced graphics team can layout to your specifications.





#### DISPLAYS

At Imagelab, you'll find a range of display options to suit every purpose. We have simple banners, portable display systems and architecture - and we have a range of products and hardware to enhance the presentation of your graphics.

# Phone: 0800 22 88 44, Email: info@imagelab.co.nz, www.imagelab.co.nz

PRINT FINISHING



dedicated to providing you with a range of finishing options. Whether you want your prints mounted to MDF, PVC, acrylic, foam or in fact almost any substrate you can think of - we can do it. As well, we have a range of protective, specific purpose laminates designed for all requirements and environments.

#### THE PICTION DIGITAL MANAGEMENT EXCHANGE

At Imagelab, we have a complete department

This online, fully managed, digital image search and distribution solution was the Australian War Memorial Museum's platform of choice. With advanced search functionality and diverse metadata, Piction can manage collections of any size. Piction's e-commerce engine enables revenue generation and can also integrate seamlessly to Imagelab's production facility. For more information on this leading application, email: don@imagelab.co.nz.



WELLINGTON LAB 22 Wigan Street Phone: 04 802 4188, Fax: 04 3843761

CHRISTCHURCH LAB Corner Manchester and Welles Streets Phone: 03 379 7179, Fax: 03 379 7217 AUCKLAND OFFICE Phone: 09 479 5309, Fax: 09 479 5308 Mobile: 0274 947 419 or 0272 800 322

may 200

volume 30

issue i

Museums Aotearoa receives funding for the production of Te Ara from:



ARTS COUNCIL OF NEW ZEALAND TOI AOTEAROA





Left to right

Cultural evolution: people, identity and the land	p4
Why were there no pink dresses? Stepping back in time at Ferrymead	p24
Training of Young Leaders in Cultural Heritage Protection in Asia and the Pacific	p42

## Training of Young Leaders in Cultural Heritage Protection in Asia and the Pacific JOURNAL OF MUSEUMS AOTEAROA

#### Jane Legget, Editor

**Editorial Board** 

Roger Blackley, Senior Lecturer, Department of Art History, Victoria University of Wellington Dr. David Butts, Programme Co-ordinator, Heritage and Museum Studies, Massey University, Palmerston North Professor Karen Nero, Director, Macmillan Brown Centre for Pacific Studies, University of Canterbury Dr. Paul Tapsell, Tumuaki Māori, Auckland War Memorial Museum (Chair)

> te ara: JOURNAL of museums aotearoa is published twice yearly by Museums Aotearoa Te Tari o Nga Whare Taonga o te Motu The Museums of New Zealand Incorporated



#### Registered office:

Museums Aotearoa Inc. Postal address: PO Box 10-928, Wellington 6035 Telephone: (04) 499 1313, Fax: (04) 499 6313 Email: mail@museums-aotearoa.org.nz Website: http://www.museums-aotearoa.org.nz Chair of the Board: Anthony Wright, Director, Canterbury Museum Chief Executive: Ross Tanner

# Editorial

#### Participating as peers

At the end of last year I participated in a collegial peer review of a new museum facility in Brisbane. Organised by Museum and Gallery Services Queensland, this was the fourth session in a regular series.

Under scrutiny was the brand new University Art Museum at the University of Queensland's St Lucia campus, responsible for the second largest public art collection in the state, some 2,500 art works. The architect's challenge was to create a public art gallery, functioning effectively both in the public areas and 'behind the scenes', within the envelope of an existing building regarded with affection by many graduates. The Mayne Hall had hosted degree congregations since 1973. It was a brave team of architect and curator who managed the transformation of an iconic campus building carrying an emotional load which gave it virtual heritage status, especially since the original eminent architect is still active in his profession locally.

#### The courage of their convictions

The Museum's director and architect outlined the project brief and the constraints, describing the original building, the earlier much restricted gallery operations, various options explored and obstacles encountered. The end result has the main public gallery spaces sitting within a boat-shaped shell inside the rectangular box of the Mayne Hall.

Two peer reviewers presented their responses to the building – another architect and a regional art gallery director from out of town. A third commentator from the wider cultural scene – media, film and cultural theory - provided another perspective. Then it was open to the floor. About 40 colleagues from art galleries, museums and museum advisory services questioned the speakers, to tease out practical issues, praise some features and gauge the response of users and the University. There was no defensiveness and no aggression. It was all conducted in a constructive, frank and supportive way.

#### Partners and peers

The spirit of that occasion exemplified a productive collegiality, both encouraging and critical in a helpful way. That positive spirit also exists within our own sector, but there are precious few opportunities to demonstrate it publicly. The new Sector Strategy, adopted at the Annual Conference, offers such an opportunity.

The proposed strategy sets a direction with an ambitious aim: to transform the way we work as a sector. Dialogue and collaboration, rather than competition, will empower the sector to achieve realistic goals, building on the mutual respect, mutual obligations and mutual responsibility that is increasingly evident both within our own field and in relationships with kindred sectors.



THE UNIVERSITY ART MUSEUM IN THE JAMES AND MARY EMELIA MAYNE CENTRE, UNIVERSITY OF QUEEENSLAND'S ST LUCIA CAMPUS, BRISBANE. PHOTO CREDIT: CHRIS STACEY, THE UNIVERSITY OF QUEENSLAND.

oLume 30 issue i

may 2005

# Contents

Jane Legget	Editorial	2	
conference papers			
Chris Laidlaw	Cultural evolution in New Zealand: people, identity and the land	4	
Lisa Watt	American Indian tribes and their museums	10	
articles			
John Timmins	The Macchiaoli Affair: lost and found in Italy	14	
Ashley Remer	<i>Ringing in the Watches</i> – collaboration across creative disciplines inspired by museum collections	21	
Joanna Cobley	Why are there no pink dresses? Stepping back in time at Ferrymead	24	
museums aotearoa matters			
Ross Tanner	A strategy for the museum sector in New Zealand	28	
museum developments			
Terry Manson	A becoming attraction: Lopdell House Gallery re-invents itself	30	
Karen Smith	Writing history at The Katherine Mansfield Birthplace Te Puakitanga	32	
museum practice			
Vicky Spalding	Wanted: a good home for these vessels	34	
Jane Legget	Creative tensions? Yeah, right	36	
international reports			
Bryan Lintott	America's hard heritage	39	
Chanel Clarke	Training of Young Leaders in Cultural Heritage Protection in Asia and the Pacific	42	
book review			
Louis le Vaillant	Creating the British Galleries at the V&A: A study in museology Editors: Christopher Wilk and Nick Humphrey	44	
website review			
Shaun Higgins	Global Museum: a crossroads for the museum world	45	
event			
Liz Cotton	The Museums Aotearoa Annual Conference 2005	47	

# Cultural evolution: people, identity and the land

Chris Laidlaw provided useful context for Museum Aotearoa's annual conference 2005 with wide-ranging reflections on the conference theme



CHRIS LAIDLAW ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: PROVIDED BY SITTER

Duncan Cameron, the distinguished Canadian museologist expressed interesting thoughts about the durability of cultures a few years ago. A culture, he said, is " both persistent and resilient and can survive the decimation of its people, oppression, exile and even its own silence". The great lesson of the 20th century is that you simply cannot suppress cultural identity. It lives on in the souls of the people and is nourished through their particular spirituality.

Culture has always been a human preoccupation and cultures have always clashed. Civilisations have perpetually been at war with each other. Why? Essentially it has been because one culture wants another to be more like it. The obsessive desire to homogenize societies is not a recent phenomenon. It has been around for a long time, giving rise to conflict all over the world throughout human history. The pressure has been relentless – through conquest, colonisation, subjugation, assimilation and even, at times, genocide.

#### Cultural divide or cultural diversity?

The Māori refusal to lie down and assimilate into the European mainstream in New Zealand is as powerful an example of cultural survival as any on earth. But that particular miracle of survival has a more important dimension for this country. It is the key to unlocking New Zealand's personality as a nation. The clash of cultures between Māori and Pakeha, which began more than two centuries ago, still obscures our sense of nationhood. It needs to be resolved but not by crude homogenisation. Māori need their own cultural space and the only way they will get it is through a measure of separation from Pakeha.

Yet the very word "separation" sends cold shivers down the Pakeha spine. Most Pakeha are happy to recognize the singularity of Māori arts, crafts and music, but they bridle at the idea of separate health, education, justice or welfare organizations. That is taking cultural independence too far. For those who equate "difference" with "discrimination", it is mistaken for apartheid. In reality, there is room for accommodation in the great grey area shared by all of us in the middle. We already have that in day-today life. It is what happens at the margins that causes anxiety.

But what are we talking about when we use the word "culture"? The Oxford dictionary tells us that culture can be defined at one level as "the arts and other manifestations of human achievement, regarded collectively" and, at another, as "the customs, civilization and achievements of a particular time or people." The one implies the global dimension, and the other localism. I shall focus on those two dimensions, and the way they have shaped, and are shaping almost every aspect of society in this country.

#### Identifying culture

The colonial powers of the 19th century have much to answer for. Their present wealth and technological superiority are directly attributable to their domination of others who stood between them and the resources of the new world. Far from "gone and forgotten", the legacy lives on. Bitterness and resentment toward the former cultural overlords still lurks just below the surface. Every now and then it breaks out in rejection of the western cultural model and the reimposition of old ways.

White settler populations in North America, Southern Africa and Australasia have inherited much of that resentment and in their various ways are coming to terms with the people their ancestors crushed. The sins of many fathers are being visited on sons bewildered and angry at having to pay the price of restitution in today's dollars. It is a price being paid in New Zealand, and it seems a high one, as Māori use every means at their disposal to regain a semblance of cultural parity. Can you blame them for that? It depends where you sit.

#### **Cultural colonisation**

The "local" is being shaped by the "global" in new, very persuasive ways. An irresistible set of forces has been unleashed on cultures and communities, effectively decoupling people from their surroundings all over the world. The more dependent we are on the globalised suppliers of goods, services and ideas, the more influence their producers have over the texture of our lives. New Zealand is as vulnerable as any country to these forces. Our doors are, arguably, wider open than any other society today.

In the economic arena we have accepted the global impulse with particularly open arms. We no longer believe in tariffs. The free market has carte blanche in almost every corner of New Zealand society. In material terms there is more choice, more productivity, more stimulation and innovation on the one hand, and more alienation, more cynicism and more poverty on the other. This is good if you are part of the commercial bandwagon; disastrous, if you are not.

The degree to which the West's universal culture, driven from the United States, has permeated the entire world is phenomenal. The patterns are familiar. Hotels all now look and feel the same. Airlines are virtually indistinguishable. So are management systems, telecommunications, educational practices, medical treatment systems, popular music, the professionalisation of sport; and above all the absolute primacy of English. American English, that is. Even the spell check on my computer tells me to change my way of spelling to the American way.

This new wave of colonisation is causing many societies, New Zealand included, to ask whether their own fragile cultural substructures are sustainable. Or will they simply crumble and be replaced by the values of McWorld? And does it really matter? Is this not just the march of evolution? Is this not what we call progress? Can any society realistically set itself up in its own little cultural Jurassic Park, surrounded by a flimsy fence built of local values, and just watch the world go by?

For a country struggling to come to terms with an internal cultural duality, much is at stake. Māori have always been ready and able to reach out and absorb elements of other cultures, as if it was second nature. In the 19th century they began to cherry-

pick from Pakeha with considerable skill. Māori entrepreneurs, particularly in the bulk food trade from the Waikato and Taranaki, were enormously successful, both before and after the Treaty was signed – until much of their productive land was confiscated and their trading ambitions were sold down the river.

In more recent times Māori have welcomed new cultural forms in the arts and music – notably hip hop and rap – and come up with their own distinctive versions. Any one who has watched the Māori television channel quickly becomes aware of this extraordinary talent for co-option.

#### **Identity crisis?**

The adaptive challenge for Pakeha is rather more profound. A semi-distinctive, homegrown Pakeha culture, just beginning tentatively to define itself, is in danger of being knocked over by the runaway bus of McWorld. Globalisation may be exhilarating for those with the capital and resources to make it work in their favour but it can be terrifying if you are on the receiving end. It just keeps coming at you whether you want it or not.

The truth is, globalisation is a double edged sword. It has generated spectacular cultural interchange and fusion – in music, cuisine and the arts, for instance – both stimulating and exciting. It has generated more ethnic mixture in a decade than in the entire span of human history before that. At the same time, however, the ways and the ethics of the western consumer have spread like a lava flow over so many cultural traditions and modes of identity,



NEW ZEALAND'S CURRENT FLAG WITH A FEW OF THE PROPOSED ALTERNATIVES IN THE BACKGROUND. (FLAG DESIGNERS FROM LEFT: CAMERON SAUNDERS, CAMERON SAUNDERS #2. DICK FRIZZEL, IFFFFRY JAMES AND FRIEDENSREICH HUNDERTWASSER). FROM JACK OR BLACK? A NEW FLAG FOR THE NATION?, AN EXHIBITION HELD AT PATAKA AS PART OF A SERIES SHOWN ON THE THEME SYMBOLS OF SOVEREIGNTY IN 2005. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: DAVE ALLEN, PATAKA



A CULTURAL MEETING PLACE -CONTEMPORARY CARVINGS WELCOME VISITORS TO THE HEART OF PATAKA, THE CENTRAL SPINE WHICH LINKS THE GALLERIES, LIBRARY AND CAFE. ACKNOWLEGEMENT: PATAKA smothering these in the name of homogeneity, the lowest common denominator and Hollywood.

Amid all this, the cultural identity of a society can become more obscure and more confused. More and more children here in New Zealand, and in many other countries, grow up with virtually no other frame of reference than Bart Simpson or Eminem, and their behaviour adjusts to these new signals of extremism.

Nationalism is a curious force; it can be positive in welding a disparate society together. Or it can be profoundly negative, if it is misused to set peoples against each other. New Zealand's nationalism has usually been reactive, expressed as a response to external events – other

people's wars, or affronts to our political or economic sovereignty, such as the bombing of the *Rainbow Warrior*. Or, of course, through sport.

Perhaps because we have never really thought it necessary, there has been precious little serious examination of New Zealand's own brand of nationalism. The most significant work was by Keith Sinclair in his book *A destiny apart: New Zealand's search for national identity* (1986). Sir Keith only reached 1940, and he ventured precious few thoughts about the last few decades, let alone any predictions about the future. Perhaps there was nothing definite enough to say. There is now, however, and one thing is certain: our destiny is both "apart" from the rest of the world, and also within it. It is the balance we strike between these that counts.

#### **Cultural transfusions**

Whichever way you look at it, this country, and its constituent sub-cultures, has undergone something of a cultural revolution, due in part at least to the forces of globalisation. After more than a century of stolid conformism, our windows on the world were forced open and the effect, in terms of cultural expression, has been salutary. Our writers, artists, musicians, film-makers and others to whom we owe the emergence of a distinctive New Zealand idiom, are pushing out the frontiers and making other societies take notice. Creative fusion has begun to emerge, harmonising a New Zealand idiom with that of other cultures. And we are giving as well as receiving. Māori art has infused others, not least in the world of fashion where the moko has been suddenly discovered, internationally, as a striking art form, adaptable almost anywhere. Anybody who is anybody in Hollywood these days has a Māori-inspired tattoo on some part of their anatomy. The moko is in. Very in. The Spice Girls performed a haka and the world stopped to watch and wonder at the sheer vitality of it. Māori artists have influenced, and been influenced by, other ancient art forms – African, Latin American and Asian – with striking results. Like the Shona stone sculptors of Zimbabwe or the metal workers of West Africa, Māori art - traditional and contemporary - has "arrived" on the walls of the world. Look at the spectacular success of the exhibitions Te Māori or Toi Māori, the Eternal Thread.

A revolution is occurring and it is catapulting Māori expression – both contemporary and traditional – out into the global marketplace for culture. And Māori are taking full advantage of these opportunities for international promotion. It is, in a curious way, a revival of that entrepreneurial spirit that saw Māori develop an extensive trading network with the Australian colonies in the first half of the 19th century. Māori are realizing that there is a much wider world than New Zealand in which to operate and the longer term implications of that are fascinating.

#### Naturally challenged

There are interesting arguments over who has a greater claim to a relationship with the land in this country. We argue incessantly over who owns what. The recent foreshore and seabed debate was about ownership rights and it highlighted the cultural tension that exists here. Is anybody entitled to a truly exclusive property right to any physical part of this country? Is a cultural property right something that should be exclusive? And who has the right to decide? These are interesting questions because these rights sit at the heart of any consideration of New Zealand's cultural evolution.

Conventional wisdom has it that, when the Pakeha arrived, Māori were living in absolute harmony with

MICHAEL TUFFERY, BULL, 1996, PORIRUA CITY COUNCIL COLLECTION COLLECTION. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: PATAKA

the land – which is not strictly true. By the end of the 18th century the increasing population's demand for more and more kai was straining a number of natural ecosystems. It is true that, for Māori, the spiritual connection between tangata and whenua was of a completely different order to the way that Europeans regarded the land. For the Pakeha, nature was a challenge. For a long time the agonising struggle of "man alone" against the forbidding forces of nature shaped the Pakeha psyche.

We cut, chopped, cleared, drained and levelled with fanatical determination. In a contest between us and nature, there was only one winner. But every so often nature would remind us of the arrogance of that self delusion. An eruption here, an earthquake there, landslips and drought provide regular wakeup calls, reminders that we now have to work within the limits of the natural world.

These days, things are changing. The Pakeha and the Māori attachments to the natural world are converging. Where once you could accuse Pakeha farmers of gross insensivity to the land, now, as Michael King and others have demonstrated so clearly, many Pakeha are in their own different way as spiritually connected with the land as most Māori and this is an extremely significant convergence.

#### Biculturalism – lost in translation

It is said that our main challenge in New Zealand is to find a manageable way of accommodating the two main cultural streams in everyday life. The word "biculturalism" is a tantalising one, but nobody seems quite sure what it actually means. Can it really be a fusion of Māori and Pakeha cultures, each a reflection of the other, or is that just a pipedream of political correctness? Biculturalism suggests equality; partnership. That has been interpreted as implying that cultural space is a zero sum game. In order to make room for one the other has to give something up. And that idea causes palpitations within the majority mainstream.

Many of us are only now beginning to comprehend how difficult it must be for a Māori to compromise and give ground culturally almost every day in order to survive in a world in which almost every shot is still called by Pakeha. Curiously, however, when Pakeha consciously borrow or interpret Māori ways,



it can generate an accusation of invasion, preemption; even re-colonisation. Michael King, for instance, encountered this in his efforts to document some aspects of Māori history. How much of a problem is this in the 21st century?

The less threatening concept of "multiculturalism" is more palatable to many, but it too is a term full of ambiguity. Does it also imply equality? Is it, as some maintain, a way of saying that the more cultural diversity around the margins, the safer the mainstream culture is from incursion by Māori? It has become quite fashionable to claim that New Zealand is now a multi-cultural country and that no single racial group should be allowed priority attention. It is a plausible and appealing claim, but it has two rather obvious flaws. The first is that we already have one race utterly dominant and unassailable in that dominance. If Māori had rolled over and capitulated, we would now be a monoculture. And there is nothing more boring than a monoculture. Ten minutes in Switzerland will convince anyone of that.

The second, and more important flaw is that only one culture has its birthplace here and nowhere else – that of the Māori.

#### **Duelling or duality?**

Are biculturalism and multiculturalism mutually exclusive? Can we really, and genuinely, have both? Whatever the answers to these questions, New Zealand's greater sense of self – call it national identity, if you like – will never be really claimed until we come to terms with each of its two main constituent parts. In other words, we shall never feel ourselves to be a genuine nation until there is a better understanding and a sense of comfort with the day-to-day operational differences between Māori and Pakeha.

Until recently most of Pakeha New Zealand and, it seems, a fair proportion of Māori, assumed that the only possible end result of our cultural evolution was the absorption of Māori into the European mainstream – by negotiation or by force. In some countries this outcome was achieved quite benignly. In others, like New Zealand, it was done with the assistance of an imperial army. With subjugation came compliance, and with compliance came gradual disintegration, leading to assimilation.

#### Notions of nationhood

The more we agonize over the duality of New Zealand society, the more difficult it is to avoid the conclusion that we need to take some decisive new steps in nation building. A first and fundamental priority is to establish a new constitutional order, which clarifies once and for all the bedrock status of the Treaty of Waitangi within a new, more definite constitution embodying a more coherent Bill of Rights. At the moment ambiguity rules and ambiguity begets hesitancy and hesitancy begets inaction.

There is nothing much to fear about climbing this last fence out of the old paddock of British identity The extent to which we have equivocated is extraordinary, when it comes to cutting the apron strings with Britain. We effectively turned down the opportunity of constitutional independence last century, because we were not sure what else we could possibly be other than British.

Many New Zealanders are still resistant to the next stage for the same reason. We are assuredly no longer British but we are just as certainly not Asian. We might be in Asia geographically, but we are not of it ,and probably never will be. Nor do we need to obsessively try. To describe a New Zealander as Asian is akin to describing Lawrence as an Arabian. We are different – the product of transplantation, isolation and rebirthing. If the difference is to work in our favour, it needs to be recognised for what it is, nurtured and celebrated.

This is particularly important for the Pakeha because, so long as there remains this curious reluctance to accept that we are what we are – in the Pacific, and no longer not of it – we will always have trouble accommodating to Māori ways.

We can quite comfortably continue to recognise the Queen as Head of the Commonwealth. This sense of association beyond the bounds of empire, with all its connotations of inferiority and cultural dependency, is something positive that we can share with many other Commonwealth republics, which value their own identity preciously but rather like the idea of the Commonwealth. It is time, however, to sever the last of the frayed apron strings and adjust to the reality that we are infinitely more than just British.

#### Home-grown or shop-bought?

We are now sufficiently conscious of our own idiom, and the value of nurturing and, if necessary, protecting it, that inevitably debate about how best to do that has broken out. This is an encouraging sign because now, at least, we have a reasonable idea of what we want to protect.

But when it comes to the protection of indigenous Kiwi culture there are two very distinct schools of thought. The first, the laissez-faire view, maintains that there is no need to do anything; that cultural expression is a dynamic that does not lend itself to manipulation by governments. If it is really valued, it prospers; if it is not, it sinks.

The second school of thought holds that the weight of One-McWorld is simply too great; that New Zealand's emerging cultural individuality is too delicate a flower to be left to survive without help. The protectionist lobby maintains that it is the survival of our identity that is actually on the line, not so much the ability of New Zealand music, for instance, to hold its own in the domestic marketplace. Or the survival of the national orchestra.

#### Intervention and inventiveness

The dilemma is a familiar one. It is the same, in essence, as the issue of protecting certain sectors of the productive economy and it is ideology that hauls us back from the brink of action. The purists point to the wine industry as the most compelling evidence of a distinctive Kiwi enterprise that floundered until subsidies were stripped away. It is a bit like saying to a ten year old child, "No more pocket money. You're on your own from here on." The truth is, some ten year olds could cope and some could not. Hence the case for differential treatment.

The threat is not to be under-estimated. Those who drive the popular entertainment industry from the global corporate heights on behalf of the Universal Culture have no sympathy with small countries like New Zealand putting awkward obstacles between them and their captive masses. But other countries have done exactly that. Australia, Ireland, Canada and France all have legislated limits to the invasive forces. Put another way, they have minimum quotas for the expression of their own national product through the national media.

New Zealand has been less definite about this. Imposing a minimum percentage of local programming is something of a blunt instrument. The arguments against it have a certain immutable logic. The strongest is that, if there is a market for local content, then a deregulated system will respond accordingly. It is all about niches and whether the state should dictate which niche should have precedence. State-sponsored art is nothing less than propaganda, shout the more furious doubters.

Subsidisation is now well and truly entrenched. We have a national orchestra that is state-funded. Likewise, a national ballet company. Some theatre receives financial assistance. Artists, performers, filmmakers and musicians get help here and there. We even have an artists' dole. We are picking winners, and potential winners, in the expectation that the "cultural industries" will contribute substantially, not just to the Gross National Product, but to our greater sense of self. Culture, in other words, is not just part of the economy, but a steadily growing dimension of our national character.

#### Fuelling the cultural difference engine

We are beginning to recognise and celebrate the qualities that set us apart, even if, for the time being, they may not be very distinct. Shining beacons of individuality are emerging in our music, our humour, our movies and literature, in our cuisine and wine, in our tourism, in architecture, in sport and in a variety of other small but distinctive ways. There is a new society – a new cultural order based on the fusion of many separate traditions – bursting to emerge from the old outfits of dependency and cultural inferiority.

The more acute strategic

marketing minds are realising that there might be something in this business of "differentness'. There is certainly a growing awareness that the most distinctive guality that New Zealand has with which to project itself is its people. We cannot compete when it comes to the highest mountains, the largest desert, the whitest beaches or the prettiest lakes; but we can, when it comes to people. For too long we have thought it was the other way round. We are now beginning to hear, with increasing frequency, the comment from international visitors that they came here because of the scenery, but liked it because of the way the people here respect each other, compared to so much of the rest of the world. And that is as good an indication that we are growing more confident and comfortable as any you could get. And we have the global and the local to thank for it.

#### Reference

#### Sinclair, Keith (1986) A destiny apart:

**New Zealand's search for national identity** Allen & Unwin in association with the Port Nicholson Press, Wellington

Chris Laidlaw is well-known as a broadcaster. His multi-faceted career has taken him overseas as a Rhodes Scholar and diplomat, while in New Zealand he has been involved in both national and local politics. His public service includes terms as Race Relations Conciliator with the Human Rights Commission and CEO of the World Wildlife Fund.

This is an edited version based on his keynote address at the Museums Aotearoa Annual Conference on 18 April 2005.



TE ARII VAHINE – THE NOBLE WOMAN BY JO TORR. ONE OF THE ARTWORKS IN JO TORR'S EXHIBITION TRANSIT OF VENUS, DISPLAYED AT PATAKA. JO TORR'S WORK COMBINES FABRIC AND DRESS DESIGN TO EXPLORE CULTURAL EXCHANGE BETWEEN POLYNESIAN AND NON-POLYNESIAN PEOPLES. THIS EXHIBITION, SHOWN AT PATAKA EARLIER THIS YEAR. PRESENTED VICTORIAN **GOWNS INFUSED WITH** PACIFIC IMAGERY, COLOUR AND DECORATION ACKNOWLEDGEMENT:

PHOTOGRAPHY BY MICHAEL HALL AND MODELLED BY KERRY MARSHALL. COURTESY OF JO TORR.

## American Indian Tribes and Their Museums



LISA WATT, KEY NOTE SPEAKER. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: PATAKA Lisa Watt describes the diversity of tribal initiatives in the USA, offering different models for iwi-led cultural heritage developments in Aotearoa New Zealand

Between Spring 2001 and Fall 2002, I had the great honour and privilege of visiting more than 60 tribal museums and cultural centres across the United States. The purpose was to gather information for a comprehensive survey on the state of tribal museums and cultural centres nationwide. Not too many people get the opportunity to take

such a journey, one that that took me from the magnificent Kodiak Island in Alaska to the coasts of Maine and Florida and every place in between. I was a Native woman travelling alone and as my trip progressed, my hosts at each stop would eagerly ask, "What have you seen?" I felt like an explorer, having witnessed a little known world and reporting back to my benefactors, and in many ways I was. The following text and observations arise from those travels.

#### Mapping the terrain

There are approximately 110-120 tribal museums in the United States today, although other estimates range from 150 to as high as 250, depending on the criteria. Like mainstream museums everywhere, tribal museums come in all shapes and sizes, are in varying stages of development and are in many different settings. There are tribal museums on reservations, off reservations and in urban Indian centres. They may occupy their own dedicated buildings or be found in tribal administration office buildings. They may consist of several display cases with interpretive labels or they may be climate-controlled, secure facilities with stateof-the-art exhibition and collection storage areas. There is no such thing as a typical tribal museum. Like the tribes themselves, tribal museums are all over the map - figuratively and literally.

It is difficult to pinpoint exactly when the contemporary tribal museum movement began simply because tribal museums have been opened and closed at different times over the past 50 years. But tribal museums received a huge shot in the arm in the 1960s and 1970s, during a time of American Indian activism, which called national attention to tribal issues, and in particular the need to honour Indian treaties and address Native concerns. It was during this time of heightened Native awareness that the relationship between tribes and mainstream museums slowly started to change. Museums had to come to terms with the fact that they were not the ultimate authorities on tribes and had to re-examine their relationship with tribal people. Behold, tribes could speak very well for themselves!

#### **Economic impulse**

Around the same time, during the Richard Nixon Administration, the now defunct Economic Development Administration viewed tribal museums as a vehicle to create jobs, and stimulate and diversify tribal economies. Four pilot projects were approved and constructed with federal funds – the Yakama Cultural Center in Washington State, the Seneca-Iroquois National Museum in New York State, the Makah Cultural and Research Center in Washington State and later the Native American Center for the Living Arts in Niagara Falls, NY. After that more and more tribal museums slowly started appearing all over the country.

Now, museums are very desirable to tribes. In fact, I always say there are two, and only two, types of tribes – those that have a tribal museum and those that want a tribal museum. I suspect that, if you review the development or early master plans of nearly every tribe across the country, there would be mention or even a discussion about the desire to



have a tribal museum. They are that attractive. The fact that more and more tribes today are creating new museums speaks to their deeper understanding and knowledge of what a tribal museum is and, in some cases, to the new financial resources they have to spend creating these institutions.

A definition of tribal museum is a museum, cultural centre, heritage centre, history centre or interpretive centre that is owned and operated by any one or more of the 500+ federally and state recognized American Indian tribes, either on or off the reservation. "Owned and operated" are the key words here because there are mainstream museums that are dedicated to American Indian history, art and culture but are operated by non-Indian groups, such as the Heard Museum in Phoenix, Arizona, the Eiteljorg Museum in Indianapolis, Indiana, and even the new National Museum of the American Indian in Washington, DC. There are other institutions that display tribal objects but may have little or no connection to the tribal groups whose objects they display. To be defined as a tribal museum, Native control is the key.

#### **Powerful purpose**

So why do tribal museums exist? They exist for the same reasons that mainstream museums do: simply, to preserve, protect, conserve and educate the public about our collective cultural heritage. But there are additional reasons for tribal museums and when I posed that question to tribal museum professionals in interviews, they told me the following: –

Frequently, a tribal museum is the only place to learn about a particular tribe:

- <u>To tell the story</u> from the tribal perspective
- <u>To perpetuate</u> tribal culture and traditions so that Indian children gain a deeper understanding of who they are and where they come from
- <u>To instill</u> a healthy tribal identity
- <u>To communicate</u> what is important to our community
- <u>To remind</u> the mainstream world of a tribe's presence

THE ALASKA NATIVE HERITAGE CENTER. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: LISA J. WATT

- <u>To define</u> tribal territory
- <u>To exert</u> tribal sovereignty
- <u>To reinforce</u> treaty rights
- <u>To hold</u> what little some tribes have left of their material culture
- <u>To serve</u> as a public relations tool for the tribe

One tribal museum leader even said that a tribal museum is a benchmark or milestone of a tribe's collective self-worth. It's a public declaration of "we are important," "we are culturally worth maintaining."

Lots of museums can make many of these same statements, except where sovereignty and treaty rights are concerned. No



other ethnic or racial group in the United States has a legal, government-to-government relationship with the US government in the way that American Indian tribes do. That relationship is recognized in our treaties and the U.S. Constitution. So when we talk about "Indian Country," "Indian Country" really does exist. It is a legal term that recognizes claims of original ownership and, above all, autonomy. The key difference between our museums and mainstream museums is our sovereignty. Everything always comes back to our sovereignty. A tribal museum really does help define tribal territory, it is an expression of treaty rights, it is an outward manifestation of a sovereign nation.

#### **Challenges and opportunities**

During my travels, I have seen and heard practically everything. I learned that the problems facing tribal museums are the same issues that confront mainstream museums. Increased competition for resources, decreasing visitation and increasing sustainability concerns are just some of the issues that generally describe the American museum experience today. Many museums are in the same boat, to some degree or another, and that includes AK-CHIN HIM DAK MUSEUM, MARICOPA, ARIZONA – ITS PRIMARY AUDIENCE IS ITS OWN PEOPLE, THE AK-CHIN INDIAN COMMUNITY. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: LISA J. WATT



SITKA NATIONAL HISTORIC PARK, SETTING FOR THE SOUTHEAST ALASKA INDIAN CULTURAL CENTER, A WELL-ESTABLISHED COLLABORATION BETWEEN THE TLINGIT, HAIDA AND TSIMSHIAN PEOPLES AND THE NATIONAL PARK SERVICE ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: LISA J. WATT

tribal museums. And like all museums, tribal museums follow the same trends, such as a renewed interest in creating endowments.

But tribal museums are faced with a unique opportunity, and a challenge. Tribal museums have two distinct audiences: the tribal community and the general public. Nearly all tribal museums see their role as perpetuating tribal culture and traditions for members of their community, whether through language classes or other cultural interactions, and some are quite successful. But when it comes to the general public, a tribal museum's goal is much simpler: to educate all visitors about the history and culture of that tribe. It is a very delicate balance, one that is difficult to achieve because it is sometimes easy to sacrifice one audience for the other, not by design but by default, particularly when a museum relies in part on admission fees to stay open. To succeed in addressing both audiences, tribal museums require lots of funding and other resources.

#### Vision quest

The most successful tribal museums I've seen are those where the stakeholders have a strong, realistic vision and a collective understanding of the role their museum plays in the community. They are able to clearly answer these questions: Why do we exist? Who do we exist for? What do we want this institution to do? Are we willing to help it get the resources it needs to be successful and to do all that we want it to do? In addition, the governing structure is clear about roles, responsibilities and expectations. Without this clarity, a tribal museum can get caught in an uncomfortable miasma and languish.

There are several tribal museums that have avoided this pitfall. One of my favorites is the Ak-Chin Him Dak Museum which is located in Maricopa, Arizona, about 40 miles outside of Phoenix. This is a jewel of a museum, made even more special by the fact that the tribal council decided from the beginning that their museum is for their community. It would be fine to have outsiders visit, but really, this institution is for them. In making that determination, the council realized that they more than likely would have to finance the operations of the facility in total. And they have done it. The staff is encouraged to raise funding from other sources, but tribal council understands and accepts this museum as their responsibility. The exhibitions and programs that they conduct reflect this tribal community emphasis. Ak-Chin is just one fine example. There are others in the States that enjoy this kind of support.

#### Lessons for Aotearoa New Zealand

If there is one lesson that New Zealand's indigenous people can learn from the tribal museum experience in the United States, it would be to understand from the beginning that museums are expensive, longterm ventures. Many tribes often find that out after they open the doors of their new museums and later have second thoughts and buckle under the pressure of just trying to keep the doors open. The "if we build it, they will come" attitude, while hopeful, is all too often not the case. Secondly, I would even encourage the Māori people to examine whether a museum is the best vehicle to perpetuate a living culture and traditions, if that is one of the group's primary goals. There may be other more interesting alternatives that are not as expensive, are more inclusive and achieve the goals more readily than erecting or operating a building.

On the other hand, if a Māori community must have a museum, then I would encourage them to partner with an existing institution that may already have the knowledge and resources. The Southeast Alaska Indian Cultural Center (SEAICC) in Sitka, Alaska, is a perfect example. Situated in the Sitka National Historical Park, the SEAICC is an amazing facility that has a wonderfully unique 35+-year partnership with the National Park Service (NPS), a federal agency.

In 1969, when the original NPS visitor centre was being planned, it was designed with the tribal

cultural centre component in mind, as a place to pass on Tlingit, Haida and Tsimshian traditions to the Native community and to educate the general public about these beautiful cultures. Today, the cultural centre is achieving its mission by housing three to four artist studios for local Native artists to demonstrate and teach carving, weaving, silversmithing and other artistic traditions. At least two artists are on site every day at any given time in rotating shifts during the tourist season. Over time, the SEAICC has created one of the largest collections of contemporary Tlingit, Haida and Tsimshian art in the world today.

The most interesting aspect about this facility is that the NPS provides all the funding for a full-time director, 3 to 4 full-time artists and programming during the summer months. The Park Service also provides office and storage space at no cost to the SEAICC and is responsible for the upkeep of the collection, facility, grounds and recently funded a beautiful expansion of the centre. The SEAICC is only required to present programmes. It is not a federal entity, nor is it directed by the NPS. The SEAICC is a native-directed programme that facilitates interaction with and celebrates Tlingit, Haida and Tsimshian carvers and artists while serving as a place to pass on important tribal traditions. That is an ideal arrangement.

#### Finding the way

There is no right way or a wrong way to create a tribal museum. When working with your community on cultural issues and possibly contemplating the idea of a museum, do not limit the options just to four walls. There are many ways to tell a tribal story and that story can take many forms. Yes, museums are desirable but indigenous people would be doing themselves a great service if they start to think outside the box, or beyond the idea of museum walls. There may be partnerships and alternatives that could be far more appropriate for a community. It will take time, patience and courage to chart unknown territory, but once a path is found, the rewards can be tremendous.

This paper is based on Lisa Watt's keynote address to the Museums Aotearoa Annual Conference, 18 April 2005. The study, *Tribal Museums in America* (2003), was funded by a National Leadership Grant from the Institute for Museum and Library Services (IMLS), a federal agency dedicated to providing funding,



resources and support for the nation's libraries and museums. The grant was awarded for the work of the American Indian Museums Program of the American Association for State & Local History.

Lisa J. Watt is a member of the Seneca Nation of Indians and was born and raised on the Allegany Indian Reservation in western New York State. She is currently a consultant, working with tribes and nontribal groups throughout the U.S. She lives with her husband and three dogs in Portland, Oregon.

INTERIOR OF THE CHEYENNE CULTURAL CENTER, CLINTON, OKLAHOMA. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: LISA J. WATT

### A new look at Katherine Mansfield

Inspired by a provocative series of lectures organised by the Katherine Mansfield Birthplace in 2004, *Katherine Mansfield's Men* presents fresh perspectives on this iconic New Zealand writer. This book provides fascinating insights into Katherine Mansfield and her men, including:

Harold & Leslie Beauchamp • George Bowden • Francis Carco • Fred Goodyear • Gurdjieff • Koteliansky • DH Lawrence • JM Murry • Bertie Russell • Sobieniowski • Oscar Wilde



**Contributors:** Charles Ferrall, Paul Morris, Vincent O'Sullivan, Harry Ricketts, Jane Stafford, CK Stead, Mark Williams and Joanna Woods.

Katherine Mansfield Birthplace Society Phone/fax 04 473 7268 • Post Box 12006 Wellington kmbirthplace@xtra.co.nz

> RRP \$29.95 • 154 PP ISBN 1-877338-46-X



in association with STELLE ROBERTS PUBLISHERS Phone 04 499 0044 • Fax 04 499 0056 Post Box 9321 Wellington • info@steeleroberts.co.nz museums aotearoa

ara

#### articLe

## The Macchiaioli Affair: lost and found in Italy

John Timmins provides a cautionary tale of the complexities that emerged during an international art loan.

#### Introduction

Having purchased a collection of 19th century Italian paintings the Dunedin Public Art Gallery unwittingly became involved in the repatriation of Jewish cultural property on the other side of the world.

The Gallery, having acquired the paintings in good faith, lent them for an exhibition in Florence, only to have them seized as they entered Italy. After a number of criminal and civil court cases the five paintings were divided amongst the descendants of the Jewish family, who notified them as stolen after the World War II, and the Gallery.

How had a seemingly straight-forward acquisition and international loan ended up the subject of a civil court case?

More importantly, what has the Gallery learnt from this affair and what strategies are now in place to prevent further claims for repatriation on the Gallery's collection?

The following is a discussion of the events that took place between 1994 and 2001, and the implications of these events.

#### The purchase and acquisition

In December 1994, the Dunedin Public Art Gallery announced the acquisition of a small but representative collection of 19th century Italian paintings by members of the Macchiaioli movement.

The collection consisted of seven oil paintings. The works were by Odoardo Borrani (1832-1905), Silvestro Lega (1826-1868), Giovanni Fattori (1825-1908), Telemaco Signorini (1835-1901) – 2 works, a work attributed to Giuseppe Abbati (1836-1868), and a painting by an artist as yet unidentified but apparently of the same movement. There was also a work on paper by another unidentified artist –

not a member of the Macchiaioli movement.

The Gallery's existing Italian holdings included works from the 14th through to the 17th centuries, and the acquisition of these works provided a further context for Girolamo Nerli (1860-1924), the itinerant Italian artist who stimulated the Dunedin art scene in the 1890s and influenced one of New Zealand's most successful expatriate artists, Frances Hodgkins (1869-1947). The Gallery's then curator had become aware of the Macchiaioli movement when researching Nerli for a major exhibition

The Macchiaioli works had been in Dunedin for 50 years and the Gallery acquired them for \$20,000 from Miss Dorothy Fraser, the sister of the late Arthur Fraser (1901-1964) who had acquired them in Italy in 1944, while serving with the Third Field Hospital of the Second NZEF. As far as we can ascertain it seems as though Arthur Fraser acquired the paintings from a commercial gallery in Siena sometime in 1944. The paintings, being small works, were sent back to Dunedin by post.

On Arthur's return to New Zealand he kept the paintings in the home that he shared with his sister. Thirty years after his death Miss Fraser inquired whether the Gallery would like to purchase the paintings. The existence of the paintings in Dunedin was generally unknown prior to 1994. Miss Fraser and her family were aware that the paintings were worth more than the purchase price offered by the Gallery if sold overseas, but it was her desire that the works be kept together, made accessible and remain in Dunedin. A settlement was reached with the Gallery and her expectations were fulfilled.

#### The loan

Having acquired the works, the Gallery notified the acquisition to the wider museum community in New

SILVESTRO LEGA, WOMAN SITTING BY A WINDOW SEWING. (OIL ON CANVAS, COLLECTION OF THE DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY). ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY

Zealand, Australia, North America and Italy and actively sought information about their provenance. In 1996 Professor Dario Durbe, an acknowledged expert on the Macchiaioli movement, approached the Gallery about lending five of the works to the Pananti Gallery, Florence, for an exhibition *I Macchiaioli, nuovi contributi.* Negotiations continued into 1996 with a loan agreement being drafted by the Gallery's lawyers – one version in English and the other in Italian. It was at this point that I joined the staff of the Gallery and took over the loan process.

I approached New Zealand Customs about the appropriate export documentation and Te Papa, which had recently had the experience of the *Queen's Pictures* exhibition. Both NZ Customs and Te Papa recommended an ATA Carnet, operated by a worldwide membership of Chambers of Commerce. The Carnet was to have been stamped by Italian Customs at Rome when the works entered Italy and the document kept for the return of the five works back to New Zealand.

During late 1996 the Gallery had been negotiating with the Guggenheim Museum (New York) for a touring exhibition Masterpieces from the Guggenheim Museum. This substantial loan was required to be indemnified by the New Zealand Government and, in discussing the loan contract for the Guggenheim exhibition, the New Zealand Ministry of Culture Affairs advised that we should insert a governing law and arbitration clause in all our international agreements. The Gallery took this advice and included two extra clauses in the loan agreement with the Pananti Gallery. The governing law clause read all matters relative to the execution, validity, interpretation and performance of this Agreement will be governed by the laws of New Zealand. The main arbitration clause was all disputes and differences which may arise between the parties will be referred to arbitration in accordance with the Arbitration Act 1908 of New Zealand. The works were valued by Sotheby's and the Pananti Gallery took out appropriate insurance cover.

As part of the negotiations process the New Zealand Ambassador in Italy called on the Pananti Gallery to confirm that we were not sending our works to a black hole. The loan agreement was signed off in June 1997. Our courier left with the works on 12 September 1997 for Florence via Singapore and Rome. The courier was scheduled to arrive in Rome on Saturday 13 Sept at 6:00am and depart at 9:00am for Florence.

#### Seizure of loaned items

Late on the morning of Monday 15 September, I became aware that the courier had phoned the Gallery's acting director and had explained that the works had been held by Italian Customs, as they would need to be assessed by an art expert from the Italian Ministry of Culture. Ministry staff were not available at the weekends. A receipt had been issued for the works.

The courier took the scheduled 9:00am flight to Florence and had made arrangements for the Pananti Gallery to come from Florence to collect the works and take them to back to Florence on the following Monday.

The Gallery assumed that all was well and that the works had arrived at the Pananti Gallery in time for the opening of the exhibition. However, on Saturday 27 September I was in the Gallery when a fax arrived from the Pananti Gallery asking that someone urgently contact the Rome Police. Having experienced language difficulties with the Pananti Gallery, I contacted our Ministry of Foreign Affairs & Trade (MFAT) for the email address of the New Zealand Embassy in Rome, as I planned to ask them to ring the Rome Police on our behalf.

The Ambassador phoned me at home to advise that the Italian Ministry of Culture had contacted her on Friday 26 September to say that they were holding all five works, as they were listed in a register of stolen paintings, *Treasures Untraced: an inventory of the Italian art treasures lost during the Second World War.* Ambassador Trotter had been in contact with the Pananti Gallery over the previous week about the opening function and at no time was she told that they did not have the paintings. Ambassador Trotter scheduled a meeting with Ministry of Culture representatives to seek the release of the paintings. She was most emphatic that these dealings remain absolutely confidential, as the recovery of stolen art works is a very sensitive issue.



15

- museums aotearoa

ака



TELEMACO SIGNORINI, VILLA WITH AVENUE OF TREES. (OIL ON CARD, COLLECTION OF THE DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY). ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY

After meeting the Ministry of Culture officials, Ambassador Trotter advised that an Italian Court had decided not to institute penal action against the Gallery, and that the paintings were to be released for the exhibition and that the Police would take them to

Florence. A copy of *Treasures Untraced* was sent to the Gallery.

We were also informed that their Ministry had been in contact with a descendant of the owner and that a civil action against the Gallery might eventuate. The Gallery was advised to seek legal counsel in Italy. The Ministry of Culture referred the name of a lawyer to the Gallery via Ambassador Trotter. However, the Gallery decided to identify an independent Italian lawyer, with whom we could communicate in English, and we approached Sotheby's for a recommendation.

#### **Court cases**

At this stage we advised the Dunedin City Council's lawyers of our predicament and gave the name of the Italian lawyers recommended by Sotheby's. The acting director then briefed the Dunedin City Council's Chief Executive Officer. On 1 October a detective from the Dunedin Police Station called at the Gallery following up an Interpol request. We provided him with proof of ownership and briefed him on the previous week's events. It was decided that the Dunedin City Council would defend a possible civil action brought by the Vitta family, who claimed to be the rightful owners.

On 10 October 1997, Freshfields, the legal practice recommended by Sotheby's, was instructed to represent the Gallery in a civil action brought by the Vitta family, Johanan and Nathaniel Vitta, grandsons of Professor Cino Vitta. Prof. Vitta, an Italian Jew, had gone into hiding during World War II and had allegedly left his paintings with his estate manager. The aim of the civil action was to have the paintings seized by the Italian authorities in Florence returned to the family.

On 10 December 1997 a Florence Court rejected the Vitta family's civil action and held that the paintings

were lawfully and properly held by the Gallery. The Vitta family filed an appeal on 22 December 1997. Also at this time Professor Paolucci, the Superintendent in Florence, seemingly at the behest of the Vitta family, initiated an investigation to determine whether or not it would be possible to lay criminal charges in respect of the purchase of the paintings by the Gallery.

On 22 December 1997, the same day as the Vitta family lodged their appeal, a Roman Court ordered the seizure of all the paintings pending completion of an investigation by Prof. Paolucci's office. The Gallery immediately struck a problem in that Italian lawyers can only practice law in their own regions, therefore Freshfields' Florentine associate could not represent the Gallery in a Roman Court.

The Gallery was thus obliged to engage two sets of lawyers with obvious cost implications. In addition, papers were filed on 22 December with another 12 hour delay before they were received in Dunedin and sent off for translation. On 31 December 1997 Freshfields filed an appeal against criminal seizure.

On 20 January 1998 the exhibition closed at the Pananti Gallery and the paintings were taken into care by the Italian Art Police somewhere in Rome. As the loan agreement was about to expire with the Pananti Gallery, insurance cover was negotiated for the works while they remained in the Italian judicial system. On 23 January 1998 the Criminal Court in Rome rejected the Gallery's appeal against criminal seizure and Freshfields filed an appeal with the Supreme Court in Rome.

In the meantime the Civil Court in Florence, in deference to the Criminal Court in Rome, reversed the first decision of the Civil Court's refusal to seize the paintings. The Gallery took the view that the criminal proceedings were merely a device utilised by the Vitta family to ensure that the paintings remained in Italy pending a hearing of the civil claim. A media release by the Chief Executive Officer of the Dunedin City Council was issued stating that 'any suggestion of criminality or improper title to the paintings is totally rejected".

Up until now the whole issue had been kept very quiet. However, with media coverage in Italy the issue was now in the public domain. On 4 June 1998, the Gallery was successful in its appeal against criminal seizure in the Supreme Court in Rome and the matter was referred back to the criminal court for re-examination. In mid-October the criminal court in Rome lifted the criminal seizure of the paintings under the influence of the 4 June Supreme Court decision.

On 6 October the Gallery filed its defences for the next civil hearing brought by the Vitta family. At this stage the Gallery developed an exit plan for the paintings. If we were successful, as we anticipated we would be, then the paintings needed to be removed from Italy as quickly as possible. The New Zealand Embassy agreed to store the paintings until a representative from our Insurance Brokers could arrange either to fly or to drive out of Italy en route from London where a Gallery representative would collect the paintings.

#### The settlement

On the advice of Freshfields, Priscilla Pitts, the Director of the Dunedin Public Art Gallery, and Joe Butler, of Caudwells, Dunedin City Council's legal advisers, attended a civil court hearing in Florence on 29 April 1999. At the hearing, Judge Isabella Mariani proposed that the case be settled by apportioning the paintings between the two parties. An apportionment, based on valuations of the works obtained by the Judge and the Vitta family was mutually agreed on, pending confirmation by the Dunedin City Council. Further conditions of the settlement included dismissal of the pending criminal charges and the unimpeded export from Italy of the paintings assigned to the Gallery. The settlement was confirmed by the Dunedin City Council in July 1999. Three of the five works - Woman Sewing by Silvestro Lega; Villa with Avenue of Trees by Telemaco Signorini and Cavalryman with Two Horses by Giovanni Fattori could return to the Gallery.

The settlement acknowledged, on the one hand, that the Gallery had acquired the paintings in good faith and wished to retain them for the enjoyment of the citizens of Dunedin and, on the other, that the Vitta family had suffered a very real loss due to the invasion of their country by the German forces, and their flight in the face of impending racial persecution.

Another factor in agreeing to settle with the Vitta

family was that the Gallery had been advised by Freshfields, Italian Ministry of Culture officials and by our own Ambassador that further legal proceedings were likely to be protracted, possibly for another seven to eight years, again with obvious cost implications.

## The return of the paintings – a race against time

On Thursday 9 September 1999 our Dunedin lawyers received a fax from Freshfields saying that we had 15 days from 7 September to remove our three

paintings from Italy. The original Carnet Agreement was missing so the Gallery hurriedly obtained a duplicate copy and I left for Rome three days later.

I arrived in Rome on Monday 13 September with a scheduled departure of Saturday 18 September. I handed over the duplicate Carnet to a Freshfields representative and made contact with the New Zealand Embassy. I picked up the paintings and repacked them in the Embassy on the Friday afternoon, and waited to be picked up and taken to the airport the next morning by a lawyer from Freshfields.

After several concurrent phone calls on the lawyer's two mobile phones I was informed there may be a problem. Our biggest problem seemed to be finding our freight agent and in the end Airport Security provided us with an escort. After about two hours in the taxi with the paintings our lawyer emerged to say that I could not leave as there was some missing documentation that would need to be attended to on the following Monday.

I was booked into another hotel in Rome and spent the weekend in my room with the paintings. On the Monday 20 September I returned the paintings to the care of the New Zealand Embassy and re-booked my tickets for Wednesday 22 September. I was later advised that the paintings had to be inspected by a Commission of Art experts before an export permit could be granted and this had been arranged for the morning of Wednesday 22 September 1998. We also needed some papers from the Florence Police to prove that they no longer had an interest in the paintings – these papers finally turned up on the Wednesday morning.



GIOVANNI FATTORI, CAVALRYMAN WITH TWO HORSES. OIL ON WOOD PANEL, COLLECTION OF THE DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY). ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY



TELEMACO SIGNORINI, STREET SCENE IN ITALY. (DEACCESSIONED FROM THE COLLECTION OF THE DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY). ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY Late on Tuesday the Gallery's lawyer, with whom I had been dealing, advised that he had to go to Milan on business and that one of his colleagues would take over the remaining issues. On the Wednesday I checked out of my hotel, as they could not extend my stay, and picked up the paintings from the Embassy and took them with the replacement lawyer to the Art Commission.

That morning the Commission, made up of three experts, had a number of paintings to look at plus five crates of porcelain. There were a number of forms to be completed. I was advised to keep guiet and let our lawyer do all

the talking. Occasionally I was required to sign documents and I was briefed on what stage we had reached. The art experts indicated that all was well and that they needed to write a report, which would not be signed off until the following afternoon.

The paintings were returned yet again to the Embassy and I checked into my fourth hotel in 10 days. I received my new itinerary, which included flying to Zurich in order to connect with a Singapore Airlines flight. The lawyer and I went to the Airport early the next morning and met our freight agent, who took us to Customs where we filled in another set of documents. We then had to obtain a clearance from the Police due to the high value of the paintings. This done, I approached the Customs gate with some trepidation with our lawyer keeping in visual contact in case something went wrong – nothing did!

The only incident on the return journey was being stopped by a Singapore Airlines cabin crew member who said I could not take such a large case on board. Feeling very tired I pointed out that they had allowed the case on board on its New Zealand to Italy trip, the bag contained valuable art works, it could not go in the hold and that it needed to go in a locker where I could keep an eye on it. I carried on walking and took my seat and was not bothered further.

#### Home at last

On arrival in New Zealand the Customs Officer remembered the media stories about the paintings

and very quickly processed the Carnet and sent me on my way. My last hurdle was an internal flight on a small aircraft. I fronted up to the counter and explained my problem of a large case on a small ATR. The staff member asked where I had come from and I said Rome, and she said her father was Italian and that she had spent last summer in Italy - was it hot? Yes I said. Turning to the Desk Supervisor, she said: "Why don't we put him in row 1 opposite the galley and give the bag its own seat!" I arrived home seven days later than anticipated. The Gallery's Director organised a media conference and issued a statement. The three works went on display. About three months later we were advised by a journalist from the British newspaper, The Independent, that the Vitta family had sold their two works Signorini's The Baker's Shop and Borrani's Woman Rocking a Baby at auction. Naturally we were interested in the sale price, but The Independent was unable to find any more information.

#### Implications:

#### 1. Acquisition procedures

Though the Art Loss Register was established in 1991, no check was made at the time of acquisition with regard to the Fraser Collection. Four of the paintings seized by Italian Authorities were listed in Treasures Untraced: an inventory of the Italian art treasures lost during the Second World War. However, this list was published after the Gallery acquired the paintings and had not been widely distributed outside Italy, and we must assume Professor Durbe was unfamiliar with this publication, as was the Pananti Gallery. In looking for supporting documentation as a result of the seizure of the paintings, it became apparent that the acquisition process needed to be enhanced. New procedures were introduced in October 1997 as a direct result of the seizure of the paintings. These include checking the Art Loss Register for all works that do not have a documented and verifiable provenance.

#### 2. Export procedures

The appropriateness of a Carnet as opposed to a Temporary Export Permit has never been explored by the Gallery, and most likely is not an issue. In this case another judicial system took precedence over any documentation that was being presented on the Gallery's behalf which had intended to preserve its own position in terms of New Zealand law. Obviously, our loan agreement with its speciallyincluded New Zealand governance clause proved ineffective in the face of the seizure.

We did not use a freight agent for exiting New Zealand or for entering Italy. This was an error on our part. An agent was not used because it was felt that, as there was a Carnet and the paintings were hand luggage, there was no need. Hand luggage, instead of crating the items, was chosen as a means of preventing delays in the transit programme - waiting for aircraft to be unloaded, staying with works in storage areas and then road freighting the works on the last part of the journey. A freight agent would not have prevented the seizure, but the works would have left New Zealand on a Temporary Export Permit and an agent in Rome would have provided an early warning that something was wrong.

#### 3. Use of couriers

Another change in Gallery policy has been the adoption of a Courier Policy. In conversation with an Australian colleague, while in Dunedin with a Goya exhibition from the Gallery of South Australia, I learnt of the existence of an Australian position paper on the responsibilities of couriers. It is now the practice that before any courier leaves the Gallery on international, or indeed domestic travel, they must have signed a statement confirming that they have read and accepted conditions and responsibilities for couriering cultural property.

#### 4. Limit of Government assistance

The Gallery quickly realised that we were on our own in terms of New Zealand Government support. MFAT made it very clear that they would not become involved in this matter and that all they could do was offer advice through their Rome Embassy. Embassy staff, however, were very supportive, always welcoming on my several visits either removing or returning the paintings to their care. An expectation persisted for some time that the Gallery needed help from the Government and that it was Government's responsibility to help, even to the point of using their legal resources to resolve the Gallery's problem. This expectation was unrealistic but the Gallery kept MFAT fully informed

throughout the whole process.

#### 5. Keeping current on sector issues and practices

Working at a distance proved

a huge handicap for us and our New Zealand legal advisers, as we were totally reliant on information from the Freshfields team. We were bound to accept their advice, as we had no other networks that we could access for alternative information or advice.

In the early 1990s the Gallery stopped subscribing to a number of museum journals and related publications. One of the titles to be cancelled was The Art Newspaper. This subscription was guickly reinstated in late 1997. Had the Gallery continued to receive The Art Newspaper and other museum journals staff would have become more aware of the issues relating to the return of stolen cultural property during the Second World War, and hopefully would have been more alert to the potential problems of loaning artworks acquired during the War. The Gallery now subscribes to a range of museum journals and we keep a keen eye on the whole issue of repatriation.

#### 6. International Conventions

The Vitta family lawyers quickly pointed out that New Zealand was not a signatory to the 1970 UNESCO Convention of the Means of Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property. New Zealand legislation needs changing before it can become a signatory to this and the Unidroit Convention. This is addressed in the Protected Objects Amendment Bill introduced to Parliament in February 2005. The Gallery is supportive of this.

#### 7. Cataloging standards

The Gallery has entered skeletal collection data onto an electronic database, though we are still reliant on using a card catalogue and accession registers for additional information. The advent of digitisation and a change in local government legislation has led the Gallery to rethink its data entry programme.

The gallery has undertaken a financial revalution of its international painting collection. As part of this programme we have been scrutinising each work's provenance, especially those works acquired by the

ODODARDO BORRANI, WOMAN

ROCKING CHILD IN A CRADLE. 1881 (DEACCESSIONED FROM THE COLLECTION OF THE DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY). ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY





DUNEDIN PUBLIC ART GALLERY DIRECTOR, PRISCILLA PITTS, AND DUNEDIN CITY COUNCIL'S LEGAL REPRESENTATIVE, THE LATE JOE BUTLER, AT A 1999 MEDIA CONFERENCE ANNOUNCING THE RETURN OF THREE OF THE FIVE PAINTINGS SEIZED BY ITALIAN AUTHORITIES IN 1997. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: OTAGO DAILY TIMES

Gallery between 1930 and 1950. Those works where the provenance is not clear will obviously require further research. This will be a long process, but one to which the Gallery committed.

#### A learning experience

Though the 'Macchiaoli episode' presented an arduous series of events for the Gallery to deal with, much has been learnt and a number of policies and practices have been changed or enhanced, so that today the risk of this happening to the Gallery again has been greatly reduced. John Timmins was Collection Manager at the Dunedin Public Art Gallery from 1996 to 2005, and held various positions at the Otago Settlers Museum from 1985-2005. He is now the Hewitson Librarian at Knox College in Dunedin.

This paper was originally presented to the Australian Registrars' Committee 2001 Conference. This is the first time it has been published in New Zealand.

This paper is dedicated to Joe Butler (1957-2001) lawyer, colleague and good friend of the Dunedin Public Art Gallery.



## Ringing in the Watches – Collaboration across creative disciplines inspired by museum collections



BELL FROM THE HELEN DENNY, PART OF THE RINGING IN THE WATCHES INSTALLATION. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: MUSEUM OF WELLINGTON CITY AND SEA

A recent example of museums contributing to performing arts festivals and the creative economy strikes a chord with Ashley Remer

In February of 2004, the Museum of Wellington City and Sea opened an exhibition unlike any they had done before. It was their first foray into the New Zealand International Arts Festival, as well the first collaboration of its kind. *Ringing in the Watches* combined talents from across the creative disciplines – music, theatre and poetry – along with objects in the museum, setting a bold example for museum participation in performing arts festivals.

#### Sound vision

Originally conceived by Jonathan Besser, *Ringing in the Watches* was inspired by ships' bells from the collection of the Museum of Wellington City and Sea. Besser approached the Museum and the idea quickly became a collaboration involving many of the muses. Andrew Thomas, theatre designer, was brought on board to design the space. Five Wellington poets were asked to contribute poems to the installation, while City and Sea's own curatorial team contributed the museological research and context.

Simply, the installation was comprised of 22 brass and bronze ships' bells, arranged in a black space with music (Besser's original 12 minute arrangement sampled from the bells themselves) and the words of five poems projected onto the wall. With theatrical lighting, the effect of the different, yet interconnected, forms of artistic interpretation created a performance exhibition that was both challenging and stimulating for its audience.

#### **Reverberations**

Having multiple components appealing to a range of

interests, audience members were given choices about how they wished to experience the installation. This was carefully considered, as there were essentially three different targets. The traditional museum-goers, as well as those with special maritime interests, had to be accommodated alongside the festival audience, which was seen as more sophisticated and perhaps more demanding.

To accompany the exhibition, City and Sea printed 6000 catalogues, which included the history of the ships, the bells, and the poems. In keeping with the ethos of the Museum, they were given away free. A CD of the composition, comprising the original Besser piece, the authors reading their poems and the sounds of each individual bell, was made available for purchase.

The exhibition was so successful that the New Zealand National Maritime Museum requested to showcase it for the 2005 Auckland Festival. Continuing with the cooperative theme, in bringing the show to Auckland, the museums well worked together; the City and Sea staff installed the exhibition at the Maritime Museum. Museums all over New Zealand work together for many purposes, although this is rarely acknowledged within the wider community.

#### Harmonious connections

This collaboration between a variety of creative industries is not a new idea; nor was it the first time City and Sea ventured 'outside the box' to create a different kind of show. Prior to *Ringing in the Watches,* an exhibition called *Living Treasures* saw a



OFFICERS AND CREW ON DARTFORD, AN IMAGE FROM THE RINGING IN THE WATCHES INSTALLATION. THE BELL IS HUNG BEHIND THE SHIP'S WHEEL. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: MUSEUM OF WELLINGTON CITY AND SEA

collaboration between the community and the museum. Six prominent Wellingtonians were each invited to choose an object from the Museum's collection store and to interpret it for the public together with one of their own treasures brought from their home.

This concept not only involved the community in a direct way, but also gave non-museum professionals an opportunity to re-interpret a piece in the collection. The objects held by a museum are obviously preserved for historical or cultural significance; however, individuals can invest them with a personal and emotional significance. Following this logic, as a musician/composer Jonathan Besser is not going to walk through a gallery of musical instruments and see them as museum objects, he is going to hear them out loud.

It is the museum's business to be aware of the many angles and layers of interpretation that can be invested into every object. By involving people from outside the discipline to participate in the process, professionals can learn to look from a place that lies beyond their training or an academic frame of reference.

This collaboration can, in effect, elaborate on the information already known and provide a wider range of portals through which audience members can enter a place of understanding. As with teaching students with different learning styles, *Ringing in the Watches* provided a multi-sensory experience that could be enjoyed by everyone, including the traditionally marginalized audience with hearing or sight impairment.

The collection store of a predominately maritime museum may seem an unlikely place for a composer to find inspiration, but it happens. Museums provide a space for the mind to wander, perhaps triggered by an object or a story, into a creative zone. For Besser, the concrete objects transcended their physical bodies and became pure sound. Often museum-goers are satisfied with the looking and forget that many of the objects served functions, some quite common, so that when someone like Besser takes them off display and back into the world, it is refreshing.

#### **Creative instincts**

Jonathan Besser, born in New York City and settled in New Zealand since 1974, is one of New Zealand's foremost contemporary composers. His projects include collaborations with many of New Zealand's top musicians, artists, writers, choreographers and filmmakers. Although *Ringing in the Watches* was his first work with the Museum of City and Sea, Besser has written original music for orchestras, chamber groups, television, radio, stage and film.

The poets who participated in this project also come from interdisciplinary backgrounds. Paul Bland comes from a theatrical and film background, as well as being an accomplished poet; he has won a GOFTA<sup>1</sup> and literary awards. His poem, *The Bells* emphasizes the aural nostalgia elucidated by the bells, both in the passing of time and human life.

Kate Camp, a Wellington poet, won the Montana Book Award for best New Book in 1999 and has a regular spot on literary classics broadcast on National Radio's Kim Hill programme. Camp's poem, *Watching*, anthropomorphizes the bell into a member of the crew, with duties and threat of death if the ship sinks.

Geoff Cochrane, both poet and novelist, grew up in Wellington's Island Bay with the ocean at his doorstep. Cochrane's poem, *Black Pan*, rich with smells and images of the sea, speaks of the old sailor, now landed, with the only bell left being the one to ring in his death.

Chris Price is a writer, editor and musician. She won the 2002 NZSA Jessie McKay Prize for Best First Book of Poetry at the Montana Book Awards. *Stowage* endows the bells with memory of their former usefulness, likening it to the mourning of lost youth.

<sup>1</sup> GOFTA - a GOFTA is a NZ Guild of Film & Television Arts Award



Ian Wedde also wears many hats, as a poet, novelist, essayist and curator. Having spent ten years as the head of art and visual culture at Te Papa, Wedde intimately knows the objects from a museum's perspective. *Subraon* tells the story of a ship's captain, lost in the fog of memory, seeing and hearing what may or may not have once been present. With the range of topics touched on, the old ships' bells had much to say to contemporary poetic ears.

#### **Resounding success**

Obviously people are interested in museums challenging them with something more than traditional exhibitions. The feedback from both Wellington and Auckland audiences was overwhelmingly positive, both written in the visitors' book as well as comments to front of house staff.

As Paul Thompson, director of Museum of Wellington City and Sea, so eloquently stated in his message at the front of the catalogue, "Our aim is to restore the Museum as a place of inspiration as well as instruction, as a site for dreaming rather than one with a dutiful accumulation of facts." Not only is the mission well stated, but it is being lived out in the work that they are doing.

Ashley Remer comes from an interdisciplinary artistic background, including ten years in professional theatre, eight years in museums and six years as poet and editor. Currently, she is the Visual Resources Administrator for Art History at Victoria University of Wellington as well as the Membership Services Officer for Museums Aotearoa.

*Ringing in the Watches* was put together with the support of many sponsors for Wellington's New Zealand International Arts Festival in 2004. Jonathan Besser received a grant from Creative New Zealand for New Work to create the original piece of music. CentrePort Ltd sponsored the exhibition *Ringing in the Watches* for the New Zealand International Arts Festival. The Museum of Wellington City and Sea is managed by the Wellington Museum Trust and supported financially in part by the Wellington City Council.



Have you thought of including any Science and Technology content in your future exhibitions, programmes or events?

Joule is dedicated to supporting ideas which promote Science and Technology. As a

centralised hub of information, advice, resources and contacts, Joule has everything you need to get your idea, event, activity or promotion buzzing with energy. And it's free!

Our evolving website offers free advice, forums, contact details for people and venues, event information and a great ideas bank. The resources of Joule also offer advice and support on sponsorship, audience targeting, efficient project delivery and effective marketing.

Joule is mandated as a catalyst, empowering other agencies and organisations to deliver enhanced Science and Technology promotions and communications, thereby indirectly increasing awareness of Science and Technology within New Zealand.

### www.joule.org.nz

Phone/Fax 04 472 3469 | info@joule.org.nz PO Box 12662 Thorndon Wellington

Joule is developed and managed by The National Science-Technology Roadshow Trust under contract to the Ministry of Research, Science and Technology.

Copies of the *Ringing in the Watches* CD are available from:

The Marketing Department,

The New Zealand National Maritime Museum,

PO Box 3141

Auckland 1015

Telephone: 09-373-0800

Email: marketer@nzmaritime.org

## Why were there no pink dresses? Stepping back in time at Ferrymead

Joanna Cobley reflects on the experience of visiting a Christchurch open-air museum with the help of a junior research assistant

#### Introduction

In this article I explore some of the perceived strengths and problems associated with role-play in heritage-based open-air museums – in doing so, two perspectives are offered. Dragomira visited Ferrymead on her second week of school. Dragomira could be described as a typical five year old girl; she really likes pink, horses, singing and twirling. She also likes dressing up dolls and playing kings, queens and princesses. Joanna, in contrast, really likes museums. She was a parent helper for Dragomira's class visit to Ferrymead Heritage Park in Christchurch. As a past museum educator she took pleasure in the opportunity to experience rather than facilitate an education programme.

#### **Microcosms of history**

Heritage-based open-air museums are relatively new, both here in New Zealand and internationally. Ferrymead Heritage Park and its counterparts such as the Museum of Transport & Technology (MOTAT) emerged during the late 1960s and early 1970s from a large number and diversity of volunteer and special interest groups covering rail, aeronautical, post and telegraph and rural history.

Based on a township model, Ferrymead portrays a microcosm of Edwardian social history. A baker, schoolhouse, picture theatre, jail, and railway station comprise some of the Park's attractions. At various times during the day horse and cart rides are on offer. Due to logistics and the need for volunteer labour, tram and rail rides are offered less frequently, usually on a weekly or monthly basis.

In total, twenty incorporated societies co-exist alongside the main business of Ferrymead Park Limited (FPL). FPL leases the land from the Christchurch City Council and receives Council funds for operational costs such as exhibition maintenance, running educational programmes and marketing special events. Government and other funds assist with special projects including the construction of new exhibits. Door sales are another source of income for the park.

#### Understanding open-air museums

Not well versed in the culture of heritage-based open-air museums, I went along to Ferrymead to have a chat with the Director, Bryan Lintott. According to Lintott, open-air museums can be clustered into three broad groups – "living history" institutions, replica "heritage attractions", and "outdoor museums" – some open-air museums combine elements from all three groups.

For example, the Howick Historical Village in Greater Auckland portrays itself as a living museum. On specific "theme days" throughout the year volunteers dress in period costume and interpret European colonial history by demonstrating artisan skills, undertaking domestic duties such as bread making, or re-enacting military drills. Shantytown, located on the West Coast, is positioned as a heritage-based tourist attraction. Based on the theme of the gold rush during the1860s, visitors have an opportunity to pan for gold, drink authentic Monteith's beer in a replica saloon or travel on a steam train.

Ferrymead and MOTAT are classified as outdoor museums that focus on transport and technology (but also include indoor spaces). Both have static exhibitions and displays; they hold a vast number of specialist collections; and they interpret history through some thematic role-play. Colonial Williamsburg and Conner Prairie in the USA are two examples of heritage parks on a much larger scale. For example, Colonial Williamsburg is both an openair museum and a resort. The thematic historical interpretation of an 18th century colonial capital is supported by a large number of exhibits which include people, gardens, places and museums; and the resort includes hotels, restaurants and golf courses. Activities offered at Conner Prairie include milking cows, attending a Quaker meeting or building a log cabin.

## The shaky ground of generalised historical narratives

Interestingly, Lintott believes that the strengths of heritage-based open-air museums are also their "problems".

First, they are rarely based on strong narratives, Howick being the exception. Most open-air museums in New Zealand have been formed from the collections of enthusiasts or places for "model makers" and collectors to pursue their specific interests. In doing so, the legacy of interpretation that they have inherited is usually one embodying the classic "what it is, and when it was used" rather than asking, "how was it used?" and "what impact did it have?" In addition, they rarely have any connection to contemporary issues whereby the exhibits/objects are utilised to promote thought and discussion on technological, social or cultural matters. In other words, they tend to be places of escape from contemporary issues.

For example, the history captured is predominantly colonial and European. While personalised, and often heroic, colonial narratives are portrayed in the larger heritage park museums such as Colonial Williamsburg (see Gable 1996), New Zealand heritage-based open-air museums, in contrast, focus on the daily life of everyday people, but again, colonial experience is the dominant discourse. Indigenous culture is usually marginalised in its representation and general in interpretation (see Gable 1996).

Lintott is aware of some of the problems associated with representing a small microcosm of history and the reluctance to link with contemporary issues. With the Tamaki Group, Ferrymead Heritage Park is developing – possible – programmes that will address issues of No</th

in which Māori have used and adapted technology and the legacy of the first Māori Contingent, *Te Hokowhitu a Tu*, in the First World War. This military contingent was essentially used as labourers, then soldiers – for a limited time – at Gallipoli. Not until the Second World War with the Māori Battalion did Māori go to war to fight as soldiers. It is hoped that through exploring these historical moments the Park's visitors may be able to transfer their understanding onto contemporary debates.

#### A thematic experience

The second problem stems from the use of role-play. How far can role-play go? What messages do visitors take away with them from experiencing a small slice – or microcosm – of history? As noted earlier, at living history museums volunteers play out a composite character from the period; tradespeople or artisans talk about their trade to museum visitors; or visitors can select to partake in a role-play experience. The form of role-play adopted at Ferrymead is a little more dramatic than museum guides wearing costumes.

The education programmes at Ferrymead Heritage Park focus on two themes – *Stepping Back in Time* and the *Technology Programme*, which explores *Wheels & Wings, Communications* and *Mighty Metals.* All programmes are designed around the Social Studies school curricula and are offered at three levels to cater for different age groups. Dragomira participated in the *Stepping Back in Time* programme where students had the opportunity to dress in period costume and experience everyday Edwardian life – school, domestic activities and leisure – through dramatic role-play.



According to Lintott, educators spend a lot of time assessing what is going on with the students involved in these role-play programmes. Operating within the realm of theatre, he felt there was a fine line between the points where something was "stage scary" or when the children have started to "freak out". Lintott cited one example when Miss Black, the Edwardian school teacher character, had a very disruptive class of older children. She took a calculated risk and slammed down her cane hard on the school desk - so hard that the cane broke. In Edwardian style, order was restored to the classroom. Lintott provided further anecdotal evidence that supported the idea that some teachers use the Ferrymead experience as a form of "boot camp" at the beginning of the school year.

Dragomira's teachers were less enthusiastic about the effectiveness of five years olds being able to grasp adult-directed role-play. They felt that children could grasp simple ideas about living in the past without the need to experience – or suffer – the drama of role-play. Whether we agree with this view or not, there is some weight in the concept that role-playing needs to be about visitor choice. The key to successful role-play within the museum environment is that visitors need to know what is happening, even though the experience can still be intense.

#### **Meeting Miss Black**

"Edwardian concepts" included sitting up straight, no talking, and a myriad of other draconian instructions. While she was rather stern, I observed how some of the children in Dragomira's class had different capacities to engage with this form of DISCOVERY 1 GIRLS WITH THEIR TEACHER, NIKKI O'CONNOR, WITH OLD-TIME TRANSPORT. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: SUSIE GREENSLADE, DISCOVERY 1

role-play. Some weeks after the event I asked Dragomira to recollect her memories of the day – it seems that her capacity to engage in role-playing appeared robust:

I liked Miss Black the teacher, she was nice. I think she was funny because she said things like "no whispering". I did like the drawing and writing that we did.

For the purposes of this article, I asked her to recount her day further; she focused very much on what she wore and what activities she enjoyed:

They wore dark clothes – dark blue, green and brown dresses and dark blue pants and tops for the boys. We had white bonnets on our heads as a hat.

I enjoyed riding in the wagon that was pulled by the large horses; I didn't want to get off.

She was able also to form a way of incorporating her understanding of the "olden days" with the present:

I think Mummy wears the past clothes as Mummy always wears black.

Later, she spontaneously reflected that she felt sad for the people who lived in the olden days, as there were no pink dresses. Irrespective of her obvious pink bias, I thought this point might be worth mulling over.

Lintott describes Dragomira's analysis as an example of how popular culture has re-shaped the past. For example, images of the past have been shaped by folklore, cinema, books and other media with the re-making of classics such as Charles Dickens' novels, *Thomas the Tank Engine* cartoons, *Milly Molly Mandy* stories and musicals such as *My Fair Lady.* 

Dragomira's belief that dresses were not pink could, in part, stem from the fact that there were no pink dresses in the Edwardian-style clothing supplied by the Ferrymead Park educational team, but also because Victorian and Edwardian life is often represented in faded black and white or sepia tone photographs and any authentic period exhibits in museums, from the eyes of a five-year old, contain costumes that are old and time worn.

Dragomira's capacity to understand history was both simple and strongly connected to physical experience.



I didn't like the ironing because it's just that I had soapy hands from the last job and it was too hot to hold in my hands, my hands felt burned. I didn't like mangling the clothes. I thought that the clothes might break. I liked hanging up the clothes [...] I liked the movie with the cat and the mouse' I thought it was really funny.

Would she go back? If she follows the usual visitor demographics of museum visiting (and other social factors), Dragomira will have a few more visits beyond those scheduled from her school. She is likely to return once with her family, again as an adult with her own family and a final visit as a grandparent. She is also likely to want to know if pink dresses will be available for her next visit. Given that future educational encounters under development at Ferrymead will include one exploring gender roles through gentle games, another programme focussing extensively on discipline and another examining historical issues on a broader level such as the role of the British Empire, she might find the answer.

#### References:

Howick Historical Village, <u>www.fencible.org.nz</u>

Shantytown, <u>www.shantytown.co.nz</u>

The Museum of Transport & Technology, <u>www.motat.org.nz</u>

Conner Prairie, www.connerprairie.org

Colonial Williamsburg, www.history.org

Gable, E, (1996) "Maintaining the boundaries, or 'mainstreaming' black history in a white museum" in S. Macdonald & G. Fyfe (eds) **Theorizing Museums: Representing identity and diversity in a changing world**, Blackwell Publishers: Oxford & Cambridge, pp 177 – 202.

#### Acknowledgments:

Special thanks to Bryan Lintott, Director of Ferrymead Heritage Park, for his time and extensive comments on the draft article; thanks also to Susie Greenslade, Discovery 1 School, for the photographs and to Nikki O'Conner, also of Discovery 1 School, for sharing her insights of her class visit to Ferrymead. Joanna Cobley is a researcher and writer based in Christchurch.

#### Statistics:

Visitors: 35,000 in 2004 of whom 5,500 were visitors through the education programmes.

Annual budget/funding sources: Christchurch City Council, Community Trust, Government funds, door sales and rents.

Staffing: 7 FTE positions including the director, education, property management, visitor services and hosts/retail positions.

Volunteer affiliations: Canterbury Centre for Historic Photography & Film Inc; Canterbury Railway Society Inc; Ferrymead 2FT Railway Inc; Ferrymead Aeronautical Society Inc; Ferrymead Clydesdales Society Inc; Ferrymead Museum of Road Transport Inc; Ferrymead Post & Telegraph Historical Society Inc; Ferrymead Printing Society Inc; Fire Services Historical Society Inc; Friends of Ferrymead Fraternity Inc; Garden City Model Railroad Club Inc; Heathcote Studios Theatrical Society Inc; Heritage Youth Inc; Lions Club of Ferrymead Inc; Radio Preservation Society of New Zealand (Ferrymead) Inc; Society of Rural History Inc; Tramway Historical Society Inc.



DRAOGOMIRA (LEFT) AND TEIV (RIGHT) SETTLE INTO A MORNING OF DOMESTIC DUTIES, EDWARDIAN STYLE. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: SUSIE GREENSLADE, DISCOVERY 1

# A Strategy for the Museum Sector in New Zealand

#### Ross Tanner summarises the direction set by the new Museum Sector strategy

After more than twelve months of preparation, discussion and consultation, the development of a new national strategy for the museum sector is complete and the final strategy document was launched at the 2005 Museums Conference, held at the PATAKA Museum of Arts and Cultures in Porirua on 18 and 19 April.

The strategy sets out a bold new vision for the museum sector and some challenging individual strategies that will enable it to achieve that vision. It challenges the sector to effect a transformation in the perception of museums from being 'keepers of heritage collections' towards becoming an integral part of, and relevant to, the communities that they serve: in other words, a central focus of community life. In order to do this museums must increasingly focus on, understand, engage with, and be adaptable to, the changing needs of their audiences, whilst maintaining a high level of integrity, and the trust of the public at large.

#### Paradigm shift

Related to this, the strategy proposes that the sector consider a transformational change in the way that it regards collections. It is proposed that the sector adopt the notion of a "distributed national collection" and move to identify elements of particular significance within that national collection. This will imply changes to the way that museums manage and fund the care, conservation and exhibition of their collection activities. It also implies that in future the sector will work more collectively and cohesively, and less as individual components of a loose federation.

The proposed transformation requires museums to change the way that they think about their museum collections and to see them as parts of a whole i.e. a national system of museum collections, not as separate entities in themselves. This will enable the significance of particular collections to be recognized beyond the individual community within which they are located, while still preserving their essential local character, relevance and guardianship. Most importantly, it will give the sector a new incentive to put aside past differences and to work together towards a common purpose. To achieve this will require effective leadership at all levels in the sector, and a willingness to work together to a much greater extent than has previously been apparent.

#### **A Distributed National Collection**

The aim in creating the new concept for New Zealand of there being a Distributed National Collection is to increase the community's knowledge, enjoyment and appreciation of New Zealand's heritage through its collections. It is estimated that there are in excess of 10 million objects held in New Zealand museums, art galleries and historical collections. The collections that we have in our museum organisations enable New Zealanders to learn about and celebrate our national identity: how our nation was founded and what we are today. The heritage collections are, however, dispersed around the country: this presents a risk because there is no coordinated approach to their management.

The Distributed National Collection concept provides an organising principle around which to develop strategies and programmes to promote the care of, and access to, collections. Implicit within the concept is the recognition that collections are resources which will only yield their benefits fully when they are maintained and made accessible. In saying this, we recognise that universal access to collections may not be appropriate in some cases.

The concept is sufficiently flexible to encompass those collections held in libraries and archives as well as those collections of New Zealand cultural material held overseas. It is also a concept which can embrace both tangible and intangible heritage. ROSS TANNER, CEO OF MUSEUMS AOTEAROA, PRESENTS A SECTOR STRATEGY FOR THE MUSEUM SECTOR IN NEW ZEALAND TO THE MEMBERSHIP AT THE ANNUAL CONFERENCE. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: PATAKA

#### Sharing and caring

The formation of a Distributed National Collection implies that in the future the care of the nation's heritage objects will be a shared responsibility. Museums and their curatorial staff will need to work together across organisational boundaries to ensure that they are properly conserved and readily accessible to New Zealanders, by the innovative use of displays and exhibitions as well as using new access methods such as virtual technology.

The ten million objects held in our museums collectively tell the story of New Zealand's history and country, and contribute to our sense of national identity and pride. It follows that a suite of national policies relating to the care, management (including documentation) and preservation of natural and cultural heritage collections will also need to be developed by, and for, the museum sector. Increasing the conservation skills of people who care for these collections is also a critical factor in protecting this heritage. These matters should be amongst the goals that should eventually underpin the strategy.

#### **Collaborative assessment exercise**

Within the Distributed National Collection concept we propose that it should also be possible to identify collections of particular significance that warrant special attention from a national perspective. Again, it does not imply that there would need to be changes of location or ownership. The aim is to enable the significance of particular collections to be recognized and for people across New Zealand to have many more opportunities to see and engage with the best of the collections. There is an opportunity for the sector to work together to identify such collections of significance, rather than to have external sources make the choice for the sector.

The significance of objects in museum collections will depend on the context or community the organization is located within, and will differ from region to region, community to community, amongst individuals, or whanau/hapu/iwi, and will change with time. The strategy proposes that there be increased effort from museums to develop effective relationships and partnerships with communities, including iwi/Māori, and that the involvement and acknowledgement of the role of communities in contributing to the care, management and understanding of collections and taonga is viewed as a primary function of museums.

#### **Purposeful participation**

The development of a Distributed National Collection will need to be a participatory process – individual institutions and the regional/local communities they serve should have a say in identifying the collections that are of national importance. Regional/local heritage organizations and their stakeholders should be regarded as having expertise in identifying and documenting the collections in their care, and further, in specifying those collections that best represent the stakeholders' interests in representation at a national level. It will also be a complex and resource-intensive process, thus requiring discussion between the sector and appropriate Government organizations to determine how best to proceed.

In the early to mid 1990's an extensive process was conducted by the sector under the leadership of Te Papa to develop criteria and a process for identifying collections and objects of national importance. However, this work was not fully realised. We propose that the work previously undertaken be reviewed as part of the implementation of the Distributed National Collection.

The Board of Museums Aotearoa is planning to convene a national forum in July or August 2005 to prepare more intensively for the development of a Distributed National Collection and to identify the steps that will need to be followed to bring it to fruition.

Ross Tanner is Chief Executive of Museums Aotearoa.

Copies of A Strategy for the Museum Sector in New Zealand are available from Museums Aotearoa, P.O. Box 10-928, Wellington, or email: <u>mail@museums-aotearoa.org.nz</u>. The cost is \$10 plus GST per copy. A discount is available for members of Museums Aotearoa.



## A becoming attraction: Lopdell House Gallery re-invents itself

Terry Manson traces the background of Waitakere City's art gallery as this heritage veteran for the visual arts prepares for an extreme makeover.

The Hotel Titirangi opened in November 1930. Situated in Titirangi, 'the fringe of heaven', this Spanish style building was, and is, the iconic landmark of the area. An opening grand ball was to herald a fabulous career for the building. Money was to be made from wining, dining and housing the tourists from Auckland. Hotel Titirangi was to be the glittering hostess, wowing the guests with her charms. Among these charms were a "wireless and talking machine", central heating and electric elevator – quite irresistible.

#### A chequered history

Unfortunately this auspicious start never quite came to anything. The 1930s were not years of surplus cash and, even though Titirangi had been attracting day tourists for over 80 years, the Hotel seemed unable to attract the paying hotel guests it needed to succeed. It did better serving afternoon teas to day trippers and evening meals to the locals than it did as a hotel. The lack of a liquor licence curtailed what the hotel could offer. This always dogged the hotel and eventually it was sold in 1939.

World War II disrupted normal social life and resulted in a limited guest list – the odd combination of honeymooners and the military. Three years later the hotel was sold to the Department of Education as a School for the Deaf. It was considered by some to be an unsatisfactory choice, but it grew and thrived. Prefabs lined the streets to accommodate the children and the museum building at the foot of the hotel was taken over for classrooms. It was a bustling happy school where the children were taught well and still had time to enjoy the beach, bush, gymnastics in the ballroom and fabulous Christmas parties.

The school grew too big for the premises and in 1960 the hotel became an in-service training centre for teachers. It was renamed "Frank Lopdell House" after a former principal of Auckland Teachers' College. Week long courses up in the leafy arty suburb of Titirangi, staying in an old hotel courtesy of the Department of Education, were considered a privilege. The day courses were varied, challenging, cutting edge; the evenings full on. Even now scurrilous stories emerge of young teachers let loose away from home.

#### The art of metamorphosis

These last two manifestations of the hotel still bring us many visitors to relive old memories, good old memories. The name Lopdell House has stuck as a reminder of our evolution from hotel to education facility to art gallery.

Next we became "Waitemata City Arts and Cultural Centre" in 1983. Somewhere between then and now we grew up to be Lopdell House Gallery. I like to think our various incarnations are incorporated into who we are now. A place of refreshment for locals and tourists alike; a learning facility full of fresh challenging ideas; an iconic building set in a beautiful junction on the way to breathtaking beaches.

And now the grand old lady puts on a new face or I should say she gets an extreme makeover, not just a facelift. And why is this needed?

The gallery is charged with being Waitakere City's Regional Art Gallery and the House is now too small and woefully inadequate for this task. Mitchell Stout have put together a concept plan which will marry the old building and a brand new custom-built gallery.

The proposed new addition will be joined to the old building but will be off-set from it at the road frontage, in deference to the House's unique Spanish style. The new building will house a large theatre with a delicious new atrium for openings, powhiris and visitor orientation. The new gallery spaces will have genuine loading bays and lifts. No



more moving awkwardly shaped art works in our Agatha Christie vintage lift. Charming, I admit, but cramped and alarmingly creaky.

With the Colin McCahon House and Maurice Shadbolt's home just down the road, provision will be made for these two sites to have office space for their

coordinators in the new gallery. McCahon House will be opened up to visitors at the start of next year and their liaison person will begin operating out of the present Gallery. The council has bought Maurice Shadbolt's house and eventually the writer-inresidence will also have space in the new Gallery.

In addition, situated as we are in the historic home of a thriving ceramics industry, the new gallery will be the hub for visitors to the Ambrico kiln.

#### **Changing face**

The new extension complete, we will move from the old building to the new. Then the old lady will get her extreme makeover. Earthquake reinforcing from the basement up will temporarily move the Titirangi theatre, which is presently housed in the basement. Then the interior will be refashioned into a shop, a café with a panoramic vista (did I tell you Titirangi has views to die for?), artists studios, galleries and teaching spaces.

The new Gallery will be able to house collections which need environmental controls. Together with the old gallery spaces we will be able to provide a varied and enticing programme of exhibitions.

#### **Creative place**

Waitakere City has a Council that strongly supports the arts. Our public art works are many and varied. Our award-winning foot bridges, designed by specially commissioned artists, alone are second to none. The commitment to a positive vibrant arts strategy in the city has allowed our building project to be fostered.

LOPDELL HOUSE GALLERY, WAITAKERE CENTRE FOR THE ARTS, IS ABOUT TO EMBARK ON MAJOR REMODELLING WHICH WILL TAKE ADVANTAGE OF COMMANDING VIEWS AND EXTEND ITS FACILITIES FOR 21ST CENTURY. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: LOPDELL HOUSE GALLERY

On our doorstep there is also a strong arts community around Titirangi. Our recent Titirangi Music Festival week saw twelve different music concerts and workshops being held in Lopdell House. Our own current concert programme in the Gallery is already a sellout and with a new bigger venue we can attract more patrons. It is all quite intoxicating and it could not have happened to a nicer old lady than Lopdell House.

Terry Manson has been Director at Lopdell House for six months. She has a strong background in education. She came to Lopdell House Gallery from MOTAT where she worked as their Education and Public Programmes Manager. She is still in love with steam trains and vintage cars.

Lopdell House Art Gallery Corner Titirangi & South Titirangi Roads Auckland Telephone (09) 817 8087 Fax (09) 817 3340 email lopdell@lopdell.org.nz www.lopdell.org.nz Open Daily from 10am - 4.30pm. Free Admission

#### museum development

## Writing history at The Katherine Mansfield Birthplace Te Puakitanga

Literary tourist Karen Smith visits Katherine Mansfield's childhood home in Wellington and finds something to write home about.



THE KATHERINE MANSFIELD BIRTHPLACE, TINAKORI ROAD, WELLINGTON. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: KAREN SMITH

"That horrid little piggy house" and an "awful cubby-hole" – memories of a previous resident and not the most promising start for encouraging visitors to a category 1 historic building. However, when that resident was one of the world's best-known short story writers and iconic New Zealand author, Katherine Mansfield, these critical words present an interesting opportunity for both the museum professional and visitors to the house.

#### Cradle of creativity

Writers' homes are fascinating places to visit; in an introduction to a collection of essays about Writers and Their Homes in Britain and Ireland, Kate Marsh sees birthplaces as being of particular interest as, "even where they were not occupied for long, [they] tell us directly about their famous offspring and reveal a great deal about their early lives"<sup>1</sup>. Kathleen Mansfield Beauchamp (only later did she call herself Katherine Mansfield) was born in 1888 at 25 Tinakori Road (previously No. 11) in Wellington's historic suburb of Thorndon. The house was newly built for her father Harold Beauchamp and the family lived there until their move to Karori in 1893. Te Puakitanga means the first place of the storyteller, and despite her young age, the house had a profound impact on Mansfield's creativity. Her memories of the house and her childhood there informed her later writings, such as The Doll's House and Prelude. The restoration of the house enables visitors to experience the colonial life Mansfield later escaped with her move to Europe in 1908, aged 20.

The Katherine Mansfield Birthplace Society purchased the building in 1986, and the first stage of the restored house was opened to the public on 14 October 1988, the centenary of Mansfield's birth. Scrapbooks and a photographic display show the house when it was acquired (divided into two apartments with 1960s décor) and attest to the scale of the restoration task accomplished. Original plans to develop a writers' research centre were refocused when original décor was discovered, and the house was subsequently restored to the period when the Beauchamps had lived there in the late 19th century. The house is presented as a 'living home'; and although only a few of the artefacts displayed belonged to the Beauchamp family, the atmosphere of a domestic residence of the colonial Victorian era is eloquently evoked.

#### **Telling tales**

Writers' homes present particular challenges for interpretation, not least the multiple messages or stories that are connected with the site: the physical building, its locale, tangible artefacts, the author as a person, the author as a writer, the literary works, and the intangible creativity of the writing process. When creative writers use memories of real places in their fiction, the situation is further blurred. Visitors should not expect a direct replication of Mansfield's imagination. Nevertheless, the interpretation of Mansfield's literature is well done, particularly her New Zealand stories. For example, A Sense of Living photography exhibition uses well-chosen quotations from her stories, letters and journal to caption the images. The visitor guide also uses Mansfield's own words to direct the visitor through the house. Rooms are presented as 'lived in' and there are few labels in the rooms to distract from the tableau. The main interpretation is through a laminated guide, available in a range of languages; additional educational materials are also available. The Society's excellent website www.katherinemansfield.com has only recently been launched; however, its search engine

strategy needs investment as currently many potential visitors would fail to locate the site through a general web search.

#### Visiting literally

A past winner of a New Zealand Tourism Award, and the only New Zealand winner of the Pacific Asia Tourism Association Grand Award for Heritage and Culture, the Birthplace is visited by 7,000-8,000 visitors each year. Research at writers' homes such as Chawton Cottage, Jane Austen's home in Hampshire, England, has found that these house museums attract both literary fans and more general heritage visitors. The British novelist and arts commentator Melvyn Bragg believes that visiting a writer's home is "...often much more interesting because of the presence of someone you already know"<sup>2</sup>. But this prior acquaintance with the writer cannot be taken for granted and interpretation must cater for both the knowledgeable enthusiast and the complete novice.

At the Birthplace, prebooked tours for groups provide an overview; however, for the independent visitor not familiar with the author, it is easy to miss the initial details about Mansfield's life. Once upstairs, the photographic exhibition and an educational video provide background, but downstairs more prominence could be given to introducing Mansfield as a person, as well as writer.

A further challenge in historic house museums is how to incorporate the facilities increasingly expected by visitors. Good use has been made of the entrance hall space for a shop. The range of themed merchandising is well chosen; and, as one would expect, there is a comprehensive range of Mansfield-related publications for visitors inspired to read and learn more.

#### The continuing story...

Restoration of the site continues; stage four will develop the lean-to at the rear of the property, including presenting, in situ, finds from the three

- 1 MARSH, K., 1993 (Ed) *Writers and Their Houses*. London: Hamish Hamilton. p. xv.
- 2 Foreword to MARSH, 1993. p. xi
- 3 FERRALL, C. and STAFFORD, J., 2005 (Eds) Katherine Mansfield's Men. Wellington: Katherine Mansfield Birthplace Society in association with Steele Roberts Publishers.

archaeological digs at the site. A programme of events, including creative writing workshops and talks, are integral to the Birthplace; the 2004 lecture series on *Katherine Mansfield's Men* has recently been published as a book<sup>3</sup>.

As with many such projects, the rescue, restoration, and operation of the Birthplace has been heavily dependent on a committed band of volunteers, supported by a paid museum director. A testament to their dedication is the heritage garden, which has been lovingly planted with species found in Wellington in the 1880-1900 period. On leaving the house, you are quickly whisked from the late 19th century to the early 21st. In Mansfield's day the area beyond the garden was a bush-filled gully, now it is the roar of the urban motorway that assaults the visitor, a reminder of the real world beyond the creative genius of Mansfield's words.

Visitors to this historic house museum can experience a slice of domestic colonial life in New Zealand, but, thankfully, the Birthplace is not a static shrine to Mansfield; rather this is a living celebration and ongoing exploration of Mansfield, her life, times and work.

Dr Karen A. Smith is a Senior Lecturer in Tourism Management at Victoria University of Wellington. Her research and teaching interests include writers' homes, literary and film tourism, the management of volunteers in the cultural sector, and event management.

Katherine Mansfield Birthplace, 25 Tinakori Road, Thorndon, Wellington. Telephone: 04 473 7268. Email: kmbirthplace@xtra.co.nz Website: www.katherinemansfield.com

Open 6 days (closed Mondays), 10am to 4pm. Admission charged.



COLONIAL COMFORT: THE DRAWING ROOM. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: BRETT ROBERTSON AND KATHERINE MANSFIELD BIRTHPLACE SOCIETY INC.



DOMESTIC INTERIOR: THE KITCHEN RANGE. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: BRETT ROBERTSON AND KATHERINE MANSFIELD BIRTHPLACE SOCIETY INC.

te ara – museums aotearoa

# Wanted: a good home for these vessels...

Registrar Vicky Spalding contemplates the challenges of deaccessioning as she clears the decks at the National Maritime Museum in Auckland

> Expansion of collections cannot be infinite, if there is not some disposal as well. As Thomas Messer, former director of the Guggenheim once said, "A museum, no more than an individual, cannot consistently ingest without occasionally excreting."<sup>1</sup> In an ideal world there would be no need for museums to deaccession. However, due to a lack of systematic collecting in the past, the pressure of limited storage space and funding, deaccessioning has become an important issue for museums in recent times.

#### Deaccessioning

I first dealt with the subject of deaccessioning, disposal and rationalisation of collections as a Museum Studies student. At the time I examined the theories and issues surrounding deaccessioning at the New Zealand National Maritime Museum where I was a volunteer. Today I find myself of the other side of the fence dealing with the reality of deaccessioning as registrar at the same museum.

It may be surprising for some people that an institution as young as the New Zealand National Maritime Museum should be deaccessioning from its collections. Although the Museum only opened to the public twelve years ago, the collection had been accumulating since 1981 with the establishment of the Auckland Maritime Museum Trust. As a result, a portion of the Museum's collection was acquired before the Museum itself was constructed and the development team was employed.

The original collection policy was quite wide in scope and there was less discrimination in selecting artefacts. This was due to the need to collect items widely in order to establish a base collection, from which artefacts could be selected for display in the galleries and around which the museum could be

1 Besterman, T, (1992), Disposals from museum collections, ethics and practicalities, *Museum Management and Curatorship*, 11, p.40

built. Later, the problem of less discriminating collecting was further compounded by the fact that there was only one curator and a total of six staff to evaluate the collections that were being offered. This meant items of lesser quality were accepted alongside worthy artefacts, and in some collection areas multiple examples of the same artefact were accumulated.

#### **Deaccessioning policy**

While there is a presumption against the disposal of artefacts from the collection, the Museum is also resolved to refine and improve the collection. Part of this process requires the examination of the collection and identification of any artefacts that are no longer relevant. For an artefact to be considered for removal, it has to be a clear example of at least one of five criteria set out in the deaccessioning policy.

These criteria are:

- The object is not appropriate to the Museum.
- The object is not in an exhibitable state and is not worth conserving, or is badly deteriorated and worthless as a study piece.
- An object that is discovered to be a fake or forgery is also a candidate for deaccessioning.
- An object may be deaccessioned if it is a duplicate or inferior to another object. However, duplicates are kept if they add depth to the collection area.
- Any lesser quality artefacts that do not represent their collection area well may be deaccessioned.

#### Judicious pruning

Whilst we are cataloguing old collection items we are also assessing them to ensure that they meet our collection policy. Any that fall outside it are considered for deaccessioning. For instance the
Museum does not collect material relating to the Royal New Zealand Navy as this would be in conflict with the work of the Royal New Zealand Navy Museum. Naval material is deaccessioned and either given back to the donor or transferred to the Navy Museum, should they want it for their collection.

We are aware that there are multiple copies of some books and serials. As our Information Officer catalogues the books and journals she checks for multiple copies of the same title. Every copy is located, their condition assessed and any unique features identified, for example an autographed book or a first edition. It is now our policy to keep two copies of New Zealand related publications and one copy of foreign publications. Deaccessioning books is relatively straightforward. First we approach the donor and give them the option to have the item back, or allow us to exchange or sell the book. If the donor does not want the book back, then they are gifted to other libraries or exchanged or sold through book dealers. Any income made from this process is then put towards buying new books for the collection.

#### Finding new homes

Being a maritime museum, we occasionally need to deaccession vessels and these can be harder to rehouse when there are few museums in New Zealand that collect vessels, so we need to find new owners who will care for the vessels appropriately. Recently I circulated an advertisement through Auckland Yacht and Boating Association and Museums Aotearoa seeking good homes for a number of vessels that had been removed from the collection. The advertisement generated a good response with enquiries from other museums and private collectors. Two of the vessels were transferred to a member of the Classic Yacht Association and these have been subsequently restored. The remaining vessels I am still working on finding new homes for.

#### Focussed collecting

Today we have more staff, a tightly defined collection policy, a deaccessioning policy and a sizeable collection that is still being catalogued. Artefacts being offered to the Museum are only accepted if they meet the criteria set out in the collection policy. This will hopefully limit the need for deaccessions in the future and reduce the problem of what to do with deaccessioned artefacts.

Vicky Spalding has been Registrar at the New Zealand National Maritime Museum on Hobson's Wharf, Auckland, since 1999. An Auckland University history graduate with a Diploma in Museum Studies from Massey University, Vicky is an active member of Auckland's informal registrars' group.



SOME OF THE VESSELS THAT NEEDED NEW HOMES. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: NEW ZEALAND NATIONAL MARITIME MUSEUM museum practice

# Creative tensions? Yeah, right.

Jane Legget learned from Maggie Gresson about the Artists Alliance's initiatives to secure better rewards for living artists, with possible implications for the relationship between New Zealand artists and public art galleries.

The Copyright Act 1994 codified the intellectual property rights covering works of art and many other creative human endeavours. In particular, it delineated the protection afforded to original creations against being reproduced without the permission of the copyright owner, who is usually, but not always, the originator. One aspect clarified by the Act was the *moral right* of the creators to be identified as such, and to have their works treated respectfully. The ramifications of the Act are by now well embedded in the practice of most public art galleries in New Zealand. Ten years on, Maggie Gresson of the Artists Alliance believes that there are other issues to consider in the ways that public institutions work with artists.

#### **Right to life**

Visual artists have begun actively pursuing other "rights", which may ultimately have implications for the New Zealand art galleries and museums sector. As Executive Director of the Artists Alliance, Gresson tries to address current issues for artists living and practicing in New Zealand. "Developing sustainable career paths for artists" is the priority, with money as a constant concern.

In general, artists concentrating wholly on their art for a living have had uncertain incomes. Just how uncertain varies according to the nature of their individual creative practice. There is not necessarily a market for art work at the extreme cutting edge, but it is artists who find new means of creative expression, bring disparate concepts, materials and media together in unexpected ways, change our ideas about aesthetics and provide novel solutions to design problems. These endeavours may, or may not, eventually be embraced and adopted into the cultural sphere or even everyday life. Art is a risky business.

What is certain is that to function at their best, committed artists immerse themselves in their art

practice, preferably without the distractions of earning a living wage from other sources. Very few established artists in New Zealand can live in more than modest comfort solely from their art. This raises pertinent questions for Gresson. Do the other artists have to starve until they are "established"? How much talent and energy is dissipated holding down full- or part-time jobs in other fields? It is true that some artists even have to work in museums, where salaries are hardly excessive.

As Gresson summarises the situation, the principal, but unpredictable, sources of income for artists include sales of their work, occasional income from copyright permissions (especially if their work reproduces well), rare royalty payments, grants, residencies and commissions (usually this depends on becoming known first). In partnership with public and private galleries, there may be opportunities, duly rewarded, to curate exhibitions, write catalogue essays and contribute to art journals. Galleries differ in their arrangements for guest curators, and not every artist is a writer.

#### **Creative industry**

Gresson argues that living artists and public museums and galleries need each other. Artists provide the content for the contemporary art exhibitions, which are the core "product" of some public institutions. This is particularly true for noncollecting institutions, such as Te Tuhi – The Mark in Pakuranga, Objectspace in Auckland or the Left Bank Gallery in Greymouth – all galleries whose success relies on their reputation as dynamic art spaces, unafraid to show challenging works in novel contexts. Gresson wants to strengthen this symbiotic relationship for the benefit of artists and their ability to sustain their creative output.

The Government has recognised the value that

creative individuals bring directly and indirectly to the nation, while Creative New Zealand (2003) has documented the numbers and experiences of practising artists and the tertiary institutions which are producing yet more. Policy initiatives, such as PACE (Pathways to Arts and Cultural Employment), are attempts to assist emerging artists, but the focus of the Artists Alliance is helping New Zealand artists achieve more income more quickly from their works throughout their careers. This is a need not unique to New Zealand.

#### New right

On behalf of the Artists Alliance, Gresson is also promoting the concept of an "artist's fee", whereby living New Zealand artists would receive some remuneration when they make their artworks available for temporary exhibitions in public art galleries. She points out that this might not necessarily apply to art works already owned by those galleries. The Artists Alliance believes that, when artists provide works from their "stock in trade" for temporary display, the artists should receive some kind of fee. At present there is generally no budget line for this in the exhibition planning for many public institutions.

It is in the nature of art exhibitions - and of museums and art galleries - that no two are alike. Sometimes an exhibition has a theme to which artists are asked to respond. In such cases, where artists create something especially for the exhibition with no expectation of it being sold there, participating artists might reasonably expect the initiating institution to provide some financial consideration for their creative input which contributes to the thematic content of the exhibition. Gresson observes that no standard practice or rates have been established governing these situations, and expresses concern that artists may not be adequately rewarded for their efforts. She acknowledges that this may be construed as a different situation from borrowing an existing artwork for display. Already most institutions' loan agreements will cover packing, transport and insurance costs and honour any copyright arrangements. Furthermore, most museums and art galleries would expect to pay the costs of intellectual effort where an exhibiting artist gives a 'floor talk' or



contributes to associated public events or education programmes. Gresson believes that some consistency in approach across the sector would help both artists and institutions.

It is also clear that different arrangements apply at dealer galleries, commercial galleries and some artist-run exhibition spaces, where sales income is a primary motive. Nonetheless, the public sector may need to keep abreast of these matters, in case there are implications for ground-breaking exhibitions of contemporary New Zealand art.

If something akin to these "appearance fees" for artworks is adopted in overseas jurisdictions where New Zealand public galleries may wish to borrow works from living artists, presumably galleries here would be expected to meet this requirement. It would certainly seem invidious if international artists received such a fee, but local artists did not.

#### On the rights track

Another avenue being pursued overseas is the Artists' Resale Right, a version of which will come into force in the European Union on 1st January 2006. Under this system, artists will receive 5% of any sales of their work, beyond their initial sale. This is a French idea from 1920 – *the droit de suite* – which has also applied in California since 1977 (Malaro, 1998 pp. 197-8). It means that artists gain some recompense from works sold before they had achieved recognition and good prices and compensates them for their struggling early years. Clearly, it only applies where there is a market. The Californian version benefits artists' estates for twenty years beyond their deaths.

Gresson notes that, with resales in Australia, an artist might only receive a copyright fee if an image of their work was used in an auction sale catalogue or other sales promotion, and even then only if they could be contacted. There is an administrative burden associated with the effective management of these types of rights. It involves keeping track of living artists and possible infringements. Viscopy, the copyright collecting agency in Australia, has made a start. Gresson saw this as an opportunity for her members. In 2004 the Artists Alliance entered into a formal agreement with Viscopy for collecting fees on behalf of 700 New Zealand artists, initially for secondary rights. Some New Zealand artists have registered with Viscopy individually, whereby Viscopy will manage rights to their works in Australia and also internationally through Viscopy's arrangements with equivalent bodies overseas. In due course it is likely that New Zealand will have its own agency, possibly through Viscopy.

#### Mutual benefits, mutual obligations

The Artists Alliance acknowledges that artists benefit in many ways from their relationships with public museums and art galleries. Having art works in permanent public collections and lending other works for temporary exhibitions strengthens an artist's *curriculum vitae*. Even when works are not on show, published catalogues, museum postcards and virtual exhibition on museum websites extend the public exposure of their art.

With realistic incomes, artists can devote their time and energies to producing ever more exciting art, which in turn can contribute to outstanding exhibitions and new acquisitions – the cultural heritage of the future. Adventurous museums and public galleries also need today's artists, both to maintain currency in their collections of contemporary art, and to reinterpret their current collections from different angles.

Where public galleries and museums can best serve *all* living artists is in assisting their audiences to understand and appreciate contemporary art through initiating or hosting both popular and challenging exhibitions, supported by high quality

educational and public programmes. This may not produce an immediate financial outcome, but in the long term it should build a more adventurous artbuying public confident to enter the art market.

This article draws on an interview with Maggie Gresson. Based in Auckland, Maggie Gresson has been employed by Artists Alliance since 1999.

Jane Legget is editor of te ara – JOURNAL of museums aotearoa

#### References

#### Malarao, Maric C., (1998). A legal primer on managing museum collections. Washington D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press

Te Papa National Services, (2001). **Copyright and Museums** June 2001 (issue no. 9 of the Resource Guides), Wellington: Museum of New Zealand Te Papa Tongarewa

Museum of New Zealand Te Papa Tongarewa, 1997. The Copyright Act 1994, a Manual for New Zealand Museums. Wellington: Museum of New Zealand Te Papa Tongarewa

#### Websites

The Arts Law Centre of Australia: <u>http://www.artslaw.com.au</u> This the national community legal centre for the arts in Australia, covering all artforms.

Canadian Artists' Representation – le Front des Artistes Canadiens: <u>http://www.carfac.ca/</u> This organisation works on behalf of Canada's visual artists to promote artists and the visual arts

The National Association for the Visual Arts: <u>http://www.visualarts.net.au</u> NAVA is an umbrella organisation, supported by State and Territorial funding, providing a range of services for artists and agencies involved in the visual arts.

Viscopy <u>http://www.viscopy.com.au</u> VISCOPY is Australasia's visual arts copyright collecting agency, representing 250,000 premier Australian and International visual artists.

## America's hard heritage

During a recent visit to the USA Bryan Lintott found some museums tackling difficult topics.

America has been attacked and is at war. It also faces difficult issues arising from the historical treatment of Native American Indians and African Americans. Together this point in time and the history of America have created a 'hard heritage' that many are attempting to understand and resolve. Many American museums have become a major forum for discussion, debate and dialogue about facets of this hard heritage.

#### You can trust your museum

Americans believe that their museums are the most trustworthy source of information that they have about the past.<sup>1</sup> This is based on their confidence in curatorial processes involving numerous experts and the public accountability for displays which are – or are perceived to be – biased such as the controversial *Enola Gay* exhibition in the 1990s. The high ethical standards of museums ranked them ahead of grandparents, history professors and the media in 'trustworthiness' ratings.

America's hard heritage is interpreted in an increasingly frank and open manner at National Park Service (NPS) historic sites. According to Dwight Pitcaithley, NPS Chief Historian, "edgy and contentious" choices for new parks have included Japanese American internment camps, a Minuteman missile silo and Civil Rights Movement sites.<sup>2</sup> Native American Indian protesters occupied the island of Alcatraz in the 1960s, and now they hold a dawn ceremony there every Thanksgiving Day. This "anti-Thanksgiving day" ritual, lamenting the arrival of Europeans, is granted special access by the Park Service.

#### Sense of history, sense of self

The National Museum of the American Indian

- 1 American Association of Museums. Survey undertaken by Lake, Snell and Perry 2000
- 2 Dr Dwight Pitcaithley, Seminar for Historical Administration 2004



THE NATIONAL MUSEUM OF THE AMERICAN INDIAN ASKS: WHO IS NATIVE? ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: BRIAN LINTOTT

(NMAI), which recently opened in Washington DC, provides a space and forum for indigenous peoples to present and interpret their history and culture. The differing beliefs about the course of history have been recognised for their own cultural value, despite concerns raised by some about the historical veracity and politicised nature of some displays.<sup>3</sup> The NMAI's Cultural Resources Center houses numerous tribal objects - the majority collected by George Gustav Heyes - that may be repatriated or used by their indigenous owners. Two ceremonial spaces, with adjoining cleaning and changing facilities for preparation, are available for using objects in a variety of culturally sanctioned ways.<sup>4</sup> Storage is organised by tribe with scrupulous attention to cultural sensitivities regarding viewing and handling. Initially, sacred objects were to be stored on a separate mezzanine, but, as the project developed,

4 www.cr.nps.gov/nagpra/FAQ/INDEX.HTM

<sup>3</sup> www.AmericanIndian.si.edu



tribes decided their sacred objects should have the 'companionship' of other objects from the same tribe, so these are now stored together - on higher shelves.

#### Face to face with slavery and its legacies

Slavery, its abolition and the struggle for Civil Rights have been defining issues in American

THE CULTURAL RESOURCES **CENTER'S STORAGE AREA** OF THE NATIONAL MUSEUM OF THE AMERICAN INDIAN. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: BRIAN LINTOTT

history. The NPS has taken a lead in interpreting, and frequently reinterpreting, associated sites. No longer do descriptions of military manoeuvres dominate the presentation of Civil War battlefield sites; instead the North's fight to maintain the Union and abolish slavery provide the context.

Another aspect of this history is told outside Indianapolis City in Conner Prairie's Follow The North Star programme. This is a night-time immersion experience based on 'being' a slave on the Underground Railway in 1830s Indiana, the risky "escape route" for slaves fleeing enslavement in the Southern States. Although itself a free-state, Indiana still treated slaves as the property of their Southern owners. For two hours visitors run through the woods as guns are fired, dogs howl and they are made to kneel - after being separated into 'bucks' and 'breeders, and being told that as a "black you never look into the eyes of a white man". Participants encounter abolitionist Quakers, traders (keen to trade cattle, corn or escaped slaves) and free African Americans before learning their fate: will they 'make it to freedom', be taken back to the South, or die in the attempt.

The programme's theme has relevance to all Americans. It has a deep resonance for Jews and other victims of the Third Reich - for whom slavery is still within living memory. The programme is solidly booked and incorporates a de-briefing session, placing the experience in the context of contemporary issues.<sup>5</sup> In Virginia, Colonial Williamsburg interprets a city which flourished under a slave economy. Accommodation and dining facilities there were

racially segregated until the early 1950s, but the historic site is now acknowledged as pre-eminent in telling the history of African Americans.

In 1965 a Civil Rights march from Selma to Montgomery came to a bloody halt at the Edmund Pettus Bridge where Alabama 'law enforcers' clubbed and teargassed the marchers. In response, Martin Luther King, Jr., led a 'symbolic march' to the bridge, then sought and gained Court protection for a third march that crossed the bridge and continued to Montgomery. The route is now a National Historic Trail and designated as an "All-American Highway".

#### International conflict

America's experience of war has defined much of its national character, fuelled debate and been central to its role in world affairs. With Fascism defeated and Communism on the wane, the new millennium was to have been a safer and better time. Then came the brutal and horrific events of 11th September 2001 (9/11). Many museum staff (few of whom had experienced war) witnessed, at first hand or on live television, the shocking deaths of thousands, the search for the missing and the retrieval of human remains. This was no collection of faded photographs and diaries to be mined as research sources and items for display. It was personally demanding to collect street-side displays of "missing persons" posters, aircraft fragments and building parts. Producing exhibitions and site interpretation related to the events of 9/11 presents professional challenges. The Iraq war is still being fought and historians have not yet had opportunities to review all the documentation, in order to provide comprehensive material for interpretation. American museums' commitment to their communities has seen them take an important role in helping people deal with the 9/11 attacks. At a national level September 11: Bearing Witness to History shares stories of heroism, self-sacrifice and survival, and offers opportunities for recording personal recollections.6

The Smithsonian Institution's exhibition The Price of Freedom: Americans at War provides a framework within which aspects of the present war can be

5 www.connerprairie.org

www.cr.nps.gov/ugrr

6 http://americanhistory.si.edu/september11

7 www.americanhisitory.si.edu/militaryhistory



A DOCENT AT COLONIAL WILLIAMSBURG DISCUSSES HOW 'THE OTHER HALF' OF THE TOWN LIVED IN THE DAYS OF SLAVERY. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: BRIAN LINTOTT

understood.<sup>7</sup> Its blunt depiction of combat carries a "Parental Advisory" warning. The personal cost of war is a central theme, along with historical context. Beyond the heroism and sacrifice, the hard facts and images of Vietnamese civilians massacred by American troops in Mai Lai, and the devastation caused by the deliberate use of herbicides are explicitly presented. The interpretation of the dropping of the atomic bombs tries to address that tough decision by weighing such factors as increasing Japanese resistance and treatment of prisoners of war against the expected loss of Allied lives in an invasion. Four 'My View' panels show the reaction of:

- Japan's Emperor Hirohito; "The enemy has begun to deploy a new and most cruel bomb";
- Dr Kazuko Hanaoka of Hiroshima, "I saw a man horribly burned ... he was drinking blood stained water";
- Second Lieutenant Paul Fussell, training to invade Japan: "We cried with relief and joy .. We were going to grow up to adulthood after all"
- President Truman: "We have used it in order to shorten the agony of war";

These statements, and the inference that this was a situation with no easy options, respects the viewer's intelligence and their right to form their opinion – or remain uncertain.

#### **Confronting harsh truths**

Americans are aware that 'the past' can provide positive intangibles such as worth, comfort and encouragement. The past also harbours the origins of disaster. The dispute over slavery remained unresolved at the time of the formation of the United States. The legacy produced the American Civil War (1861-65) with over half a million deaths, the Civil Rights Movement of the 1960s and ongoing race relations issues. The events of 9/11 forced many Americans to look beyond their borders to the wider world, and their place in it. American museums are quick to remind their

communities that 'those who forget the past are bound to repeat it'. Complexities of the current situation pose a challenge – which parts of the past are relevant in 2005: the fall of communism in 1989? the Vietnam War? or is a new paradigm emerging?

Exploring their "hard heritage" gives Americans an opportunity to understand the past, evaluate courses



'OUR VIEW' PANELS ON THE DROPPING OF THE ATOMIC BOMBS, IN THE NATIONAL MUSEUM OF AMERICAN HISTORY. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: BRIAN LINTOTT

of action and consider possible consequences. America's museums still allow a respite from the present, a pleasurable meandering through palatable aspects of the past, but many increasingly engage visitors with hard questions about their heritage and contemporary issues of cultural identity, sacrifice, life and death, equality and freedom.

Bryan Lintott is Director of Ferrymead Heritage Park. He visited the United States in 2001 as a Churchill Fellow. In 2004 he attended The Seminar For Historical Administration, in Indianapolis, and visited a number of Washington DC museums as a guest of the Department of State.

# Training of Young Leaders in Cultural Heritage Protection in Asia and the Pacific

Chanel Clarke finds common ground with other young heritage professionals in the wider Asia-Pacific region

> In September 2004 I was fortunate enough to be nominated to attend the "Training of Young Leaders in Cultural Heritage Protection in Asia and the Pacific", hosted by the Cultural Heritage Protection Cooperation Office, Asia Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU) in Nara, Japan. This training programme, the fifth of its kind hosted by the

> ACCU Nara Office, aims to provide young professionals in the fields of cultural heritage protection from UNESCO Member States in Asia and the Pacific, with training in cultural heritage protection, and opportunities for exchanging ideas with Japan's younger generation. Representatives from Australia, China, Iran, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Myanmar, New Zealand, Sri Lanka, Uzbekistan, and Vietnam participated in the two-week training course.

#### Japan's heritage heartland

Nara, located in Western Honshu, is the ancient capital of Japan. Buddhism had originally been introduced into the country from continental Asia, but its culture and architecture subsequently developed independently as Japan became the eastern end of the Silk Road. Nara blossomed with this development. Heijo Palace and other examples of Nara's distinctive cultural heritage came to prominence in this era of cultural and political ascendancy. This makes Nara ideally suited for the training programme, which consisted of a range of lectures presented by various experts in the cultural heritage field and numerous site visits. These visits included those temples and shrines nominated on the World Heritage List, and a number of other highly significant temples within the region. Our site visits also included a number of museums, and



THE HEAD PRIEST IN FRONT OF THE GREAT BUDDHA HALL, THE WORLD'S LARGEST WOODEN STRUCTURE, AT TODAI-JI TEMPLE, NARA. THE TEMPLE WAS ERECTED WHEN NARA WAS JAPAN'S CAPITAL. IT WAS INSCRIBED AS A WORLD HERITAGE SITE IN 1998. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: CHANEL CLARK, AUCKLAND WAR MEMORIAL MUSEUM

contact with World Heritage Course students from Nara University and a number of archaeological institutes and conservation centres.

#### Professional and personal insights

Some of the outstanding points for me included some of the newer museum facilities including Man'yo Culture Museum in the Asuka region and the Byodoin Museum in Ugi City. The display techniques and use of multimedia at these museums were particularly impressive. For my own future exhibition planning, I made notes about the uncluttered approach to artefact display, particularly at the Byodoin Museum. Similarly the integration of both of these facilities into the existing landscape is to be commended. The Man'yo Museum was an especially good example of how to utilise local cultural properties for community employment and revitalization.

Other stimulating aspects of the programme included the chance for dialogue with colleagues, gaining a greater appreciation of heritage protection on a global scale. More specifically I enjoyed the Home Stay with a Japanese family, which was a good chance to experience Japanese daily life. The most memorable activity was the day spent at Ichijo

EXTERIOR VIEW OF THE MAN'YO CULTURE MUSEUM WITH RECONSTRUCTED GARDENS WITH TREES AND PLANTS THAT INSPIRED THE MAN'YO POETS. ACKNOW EDGEMENT: CHANFI

CLARK, AUCKLAND WAR

MEMORIAL MUSEUM



Senior High School in Nara City interacting with the

students, who were so enthusiastic, and touring the remains of Heijo Palace with them. They are lucky to encounter cultural heritage protection activities so early in their schooling; this close proximity to such world class heritage sites offers this rare opportunity.

#### When nature meets culture...

The highlight of this year's programme was to be a visit to the Kii Mountain Range which was recently inscribed on the UNESCO World Heritage List. Unfortunately an impending typhoon cancelled this part of the programme. The Kii Mountain Range is located to the south of Kyoto and Nara. The mountains occupy most of the area known as the Kii Peninsula, a landmass jutting into the Pacific Ocean. The mountains have been Japan's spiritual heartland through the ages. Over time, three mountain areas in particular, Yoshino-Omine, Kumano Sanzan and Koyasan, came to be revered as sacred places associated with certain religious groups. The three sacred sites with three pilgrimage routes located in the mountain range play an important role in Japan's cultural heritage and together represent the "Sacred Sites and Pilgrimage Routes in the Kii Mountain Range and the Cultural Landscapes that Surround Them."

#### Intangible evidence and World Heritage Status

While we were not physically able to visit the Kii Mountain Range, the issues involved in attaining World Heritage Status for these significant cultural landscapes were explained. The work of the Japanese has been important in raising awareness about the limitations of the narrow approach to heritage protection to date. Until now the principal focus has been on physical monuments of historical, cultural and religious significance. More importantly, the intangible values and references to cultural aspects of the landscape, as instanced in poetry, songs and other oral traditions, need recognition as valid forms of evidence in the protection and preservation of sites for World Heritage status. It will be increasingly important for us to grasp much wider and more comprehensive definitions of "cultural heritage" beyond mere tangible historical

CONSERVATORS AT WORK AT THE GANGOJI INSTITUTE, CENTRE FOR CONSERVATION SCIENCE IN NARA. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: CHANEL CLARK, AUCKLAND WAR MEMORIAL MUSEUM

monuments, buildings or sites. Similarly, while individual sites may not merit protection on their own, within a group they may form a part of the cultural significance of a landscape and should be recognized as such.

#### **Reflecting well on New Zealand**

Intangible cultural heritage is the new frontier of heritage preservation work, as shown by the adoption of the new International Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage at the UNESCO General Conference in 2003. The Japanese efforts in raising awareness amongst UNESCO member countries of the equal importance of sacred sites, landscapes and intangible cultural heritage will be valuable for cultural heritage protection in New Zealand and across the Pacific. Tongariro National Park in New Zealand was the first site in the world to be recognized for both its natural and cultural significance, and remains a leading example to the region and the world. The recognition of intangible cultural heritage will continue to feature in the future registration of sites in New Zealand, particularly those where their significance and meaning to Māori is inextricably associated with intangible values such as oral traditions and whakapapa.

Of course a training programme such as this enables one to recognize the strengths and weaknesses of our own cultural heritage protection and management programmes in New Zealand. It makes you appreciate those aspects that you know are done well in your own country or similar projects being undertaken but just in different ways. We obviously face similar issues to those Asia/Pacific countries represented on the programme. I guess that the challenge for all countries, however, continues to be finding the harmony between development and preservation works.

Chanel Clarke (Ngapuhi, Te Rarawa, Ngati Porou and Tainui) is Curator Māori at the Auckland War Memorial Museum. She was nominated for this programme by the Culture Sub-Commission of the New Zealand National Commission for UNESCO.

The Department of Conservation is currently assessing proposals for additional New Zealand sites to be submitted for World Heritage status in 2006.



EXTERNAL ROOF RESTORATION WORK BEING UNDERTAKEN AT NISHI HONGWANJI TEMPLE, KYOTO. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: CHANEL CLARK, AUCKLAND WAR MEMORIAL MUSEUM

#### Creating the British Galleries at the V&A: A study in museology

Christopher Wilk and Nick Humphrey (Eds.), 2004 V&A Publications, Laboratorio Museotechnico Goppion, London, \$140 US

#### Reviewed by Louis Le Vaillant

The new *British Galleries* 1500 – 1900 opened at the Victoria and Albert Museum (V&A), London, in 2001, after five years development and fifty years since they were re-installed after World War II. In such a period of time vast changes have occurred in the ways museums work and the manner in which they interface objects with their publics.

Hailed as "groundbreaking and stunningly beautiful" the British Galleries went on to win the European Museum of the Year Award (2003) for the V&A. Such acclaim led to a flurry of requests for information of 'how did you?' and 'how to?' develop such a large-scale gallery installation. This study manual was produced to inform and answer the innumerable requests that the V&A staff now receive.

The completed galleries are vast covering 15 galleries on two floors, which is over 3,400 m<sup>2</sup> or 10% of the museum's display space. The scale of the project was immense, the largest gallery redevelopment the Museum had undertaken – even considering the well received Silver and Glass galleries, amongst other preceding refurbishments.

## Teaming up for a stylish professional response

Fundamental to the new approach to the display was the implementation of unconventional teams and ways of working within an established culture of a large and segmented institution. The development of the Concept Team proposed by Christopher Wilk is referred to regularly. Wilk initially implemented a small team of three including himself, Gail Durbin, then head of the gallery education and Sarah Medlam, the deputy curator of the project and subject specialist of the period. Following a six-month intensive research project, this cohesive unit crystallised the proposal for the show after visiting other museums and display styles.

Staff applied to work on the show and new gallery "style teams" were established and divided into three groups to work on the historical periods; Tudor and Stuarts, Hanoverian and Victorians. A researcher, an educator and a curatorial assistant headed each of these groups. The Concept Team provided advice and the curatorial overview required to maintain consistency with the overall display.

#### Addressing audience perspectives

Parallel to concept development, Gail Durbin took the opportunity to embrace audience learning and participation in the preliminary planning. This enabled the Museum to be conscious of, and driven by, learning styles of the potential audience with information drawn from visits to, and interpretation of audiences predominantly (and unexpectedly for the visual arts) from, science museums. Primarily these non artgallery models were American, but other conventional venues such as the Henry Francis Du Pont Winterthur Museum of Decorative Arts in Delaware and the Art Gallery of Ontario in Toronto were also used as exemplars.

#### Documenting the delivery

Such a detailed manual provides a record of the history, conceptualisation and delivery of an immense project. Every conceivable aspect of the project planning and development is discussed. Anthony Burton's history of the decorative arts galleries is a study in museum display history, perseverance, patience and politics. With all the suspense of a gripping thriller, Gwyn Miles effectively explains the formulation of the teams, Gant charts, communication and monitoring processes formulated for the project. The penultimate chapter by Giovanni Pinni is slightly irksome in its theoretical rather than spontaneous attempt to respond to the completed exhibition. The appendices, which include most of the working documents of the galleries, are informative and helpful. While the 'pros' are well evidenced, it is refreshing and revealing that additionally the 'cons' are candidly documented.

Creating the British Galleries continues the conversation about this outstanding project, object gallery and visitor experience. Its documentation for curators, educators and designers goes a long way to becoming an ongoing major resource for all museum workers.

Louis Le Vaillant is Curator of Applied Arts at the Auckland War Memorial Museum, where he is currently planning the re-display of the decorative arts collection. As the Clarke Collection Scholar for 2004, he had the privilege of an internship at the Victoria and Albert Museum.



## Global Museum: a crossroads for the museum world.

# Shaun Higgins reviews a New Zealand success story connecting the international museum community through the World Wide Web

The internet website known as Global Museum is a webzine (a web magazine) of international repute and can be viewed at www.globalmuseum.org. It hosts material concerning museums from around the globe in the form of both news and a book store, provides information regarding museum careers, offers a travel service and provides regular job information including a mailing list. Museum professionals and enthusiasts from around the world are presented with a site with diverse and relevant content associated with the museum sector, without going into too much subject-specific detail. The webzine's designer and manager, Roger Smith, stated "Global Museum aims for immediacy of information rather than in-depth analysis of museological issues." (Smith, 2001) As such it is much more than a webzine, offering the added function of a navigation tool for those seeking information and resources relating to museums.

#### Small beginnings

Initially, Smith started the site as "an affiliate of Amazon to sell books about museums and history." (Brislen, 2004) It soon became much more as he created a niche in hitherto uncovered territory. As a former UN worker and museum professional, Smith was aware of the communication needs of the international museum sector. The site grew into a veritable portal of museum-related information and today Global Museum aspires, "to be the international museum compendium site on the Internet." (Smith, 2001) Despite its e-commerce origins, the site maintains a primarily non-profit status, affiliated only to forprofit organisations such as Amazon Online Bookshop. With its international success, it has diversified further, now offering Global Museum Travel, provided in connection with Travel Provider.

#### International intelligence

Navigating the site is fairly straightforward, guided by a simple title banner and image with buttons below. The homepage could be described as somewhat modest in nature, when considering the huge diversity of material found beyond the buttons.

In its news section, the webzine maintains excellent international museum coverage, bringing together small news items that would otherwise only be found in localised publications. From "Mammoths in Japan" to "Aliens in Fort Myers" (U.S.A), the global coverage provides a host of refreshing details that are often overlooked in larger publications.

Another function of the webzine is to provide current information about job opportunities in museum related-environments around the world. I have followed this part of the webzine for some time, noting that it includes local New Zealand postings as well as those from countries near and far. One criticism, however, is the distinction made between "Museum Jobs" and "Museum jobs outside the USA." Whilst the majority of the webzine's job listings are indeed American, I find the distinction unnecessary. It is somewhat derogatory for a site that purports to be international to divide the world into America and the rest. I assume it is merely catering to a user majority.

#### Intellectual reach

The books section offers a bibliography of museum related publications with hyperlinks to Amazon Online Bookshop (amazon.com) where they can be purchased. These pages cover a range of media, such as books and DVDs as well as offering separate listings on art museums and archaeology/anthropology.

To complement the books section, the webzine also includes a section entitled "Ideas and Resources." This section provides hyperlinks to information resources covering topics such as world heritage, marketing, conservation, artefact analysis as well as a museum resources area. Viewers can also contribute resources of their own by filling in a small



A SCREENSHOT OF THE GLOBAL MUSEUM HOMEPAGE. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: GLOBAL MUSEUM <text>

A SCREENSHOT OF THE BOOKS SECTION. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: GLOBAL MUSEUM

online form included on the page.

If you are interested in finding out about museum courses offered around the globe, the webzine also has a study section. A series of hyperlinks connects users to various museum and heritage courses offered by institutions internationally. These comprise subjects such as museology, archaeology and conservation. Once again, a small online form is offered for courses the viewer may wish to add to the list.

#### Linking up, staying connected

On the links page there are more general links connecting to yet other link sites and some virtual museums. Compared to the preceding pages, this web page is somewhat lacking in content, perhaps because the others already offer a large collection of museum links.

A mailing list is connected to the webzine. This allows subscribers to receive regular news updates via email and to post advertisements for jobs in the museum sector. However, casual browsing without subscription to the webzine is unrestricted, so it is possible to access the site in its entirety before joining it.

From an interactive standpoint, the webzine offers fast and effective access to an extremely large range of resources. Most resources are only a couple of clicks away from the homepage, presenting users with a tool as helpful to museum professionals and students alike. The content is substantial in scope rather than detail. You might not necessarily find highly subject-specific material but a general link will set you in the right direction; as such the webzine proves to be a useful surfing aid. The interface is designed with potential to expand. The headings are arranged simply across the front-page beneath the image, with room for new headings to extend the webzine's breadth even further without necessarily redesigning the format. I would suggest adding a listing of museum web addresses from around the world, a directory of sorts.

#### **Global conclusions**

Given its breadth of content, the webzine cannot be said to focus on any particular type of user. The site is useful to anyone associated with the museum sector, from students to curators. In many ways its primary function is as a portal to other information sources and as a museum news gatherer, which it does quite thoroughly and effectively.

In keeping with its status as a global museum site, the webzine does not overemphasize New Zealand museums. It provides news and advertisements that may feature New Zealand, but only as a part of a worldwide, rather than local, community. The webzine's focus is international and in most cases it conforms to that goal. In 2004 the site was voted the best "museum professional's site", at the time being visited by more than 6000 professionals in 107 countries. (Brislen, 2004) A crossroads for all museum enthusiasts and professionals alike, Global Museum is set to become a key resource in the museum world.

Shaun Higgins is an archaeologist and museum technician currently working at the Auckland War Memorial Museum and the University of Auckland.

The Global Museum website is: www.globalmuseum.org

#### References:

BRISLEN. P., 2004. 'Museums site given the nod as No. 1 exhibit.' **The New Zealand Herald**, 15/06/2004.

SMITH. R., 2001. 'Global Museum: A Personal Vision that became an Online Success.' **Cultivate Interactive**, issue 4, 7 May 2001 URL: <u>http://www.cultivate-int.org/issue4/global/</u>

# The Museums Aotearoa Annual Conference 2005:

### Cultural Evolution in New Zealand: people, identity and the land Liz Cotton reviews the Museums Aotearoa

The 2005 Museums Aotearoa Conference was hosted by PATAKA - Porirua Museum of Arts and Cultures. Porirua City was an appropriate venue for the conference theme: Cultural Evolution in New Zealand: people, identity and the land. The delegates were mainly museum professionals, the majority being Directors, Managers or CEOs. Registrars and Collection Managers formed a small group of about 25-30. There was a good cross section of North and South Island institutions, and attendance reflected the diverse size and scope of the museums sector in Aotearoa New Zealand. Attendance on the first day was around 180 people, thought to be a record; this dropped off significantly during Day Two.

#### **Cultural evolution**

Darcy Nicholas, General Manager of Pataka, and Te Taru White, Kaihautu of Te Papa Tongarewa, stepped in together when political constraints prevented John Tamihere opening the programme as first keynote speaker. Darcy Nicholas addressed the conference theme through a thoughtful delivery on the difficulties in determining the true nature of New Zealanders in today's society, and the need for all New Zealanders to stand as one people. Culture is constantly evolving. Both speakers highlighted the significant changes in Māori culture since first encounters with Europeans, through Pakeha domination and the Treaty of Waitangi, to the growing achievements of Māori in intellectual, business and leadership forums.

Nicholas and White examined the concept of 'biculturalism', suggesting a working definition which allows Māori and Pakeha to be themselves, while respecting and learning from each other. They challenged the museum sector to be at the centre of this learning and respect through fostering of

Annual Conference, 18-20 April, 2005

creative arts, oral histories, respect and nurturing of elders, creating knowledge for all New Zealanders.

Museums and galleries are the creation of peoples and nations. The paradox is that, while museums lose value if they are solely the creation of individuals, they need to be driven by individuals. It is our responsibility to ensure that these individuals are representative of the nation as a whole. The future holds continued economic and political advancement for Māori and a renewed focus on cultural evolution as part of socio-economic recovery. The implications for heritage institutions are the needs to develop trusting relationships, to build capacity, to understand fully issues of guardianship and narrative, and a sharing of power. Through these holistic approaches real value can be assigned to the notion of biculturalism.

Lisa Watt's keynote address about the status of North American tribes, the path of selfdetermination and a tour of Native American museums offered valuable insights into developments in the United States, providing much food for thought about the potential development of iwi-led museums in this country. The other keynote speakers, including broadcaster Chris Laidlaw, addressed the theme of cultural evolution in New Zealand. Issues around biculturalism were discussed in terms of whether biculturalism equals equality, the potential clash between biculturalism and multiculturalism and the development of bicultural institutions in New Zealand. Chris Laidlaw spoke about the cultural survival of M\_ori, stressing



KEYNOTE SPEAKER, DARCY NICHOLAS, LAUNCHES THE MUSEUMS AOTEAROA CONFERENCE 2005, HOSTED BY HIS OWN INSTITUTION PATAKA -PORIRUA MUSEUM OF ARTS AND CULTURES. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: ΡΑΤΑΚΑ



PATAKA'S SIGNAGE ANNOUNCES ITS EMBRACE OF CULTURAL DIVERSITY. PATAKA IS PORIURA'S MUSEUM OF ARTS AND CULTURE. ACKNOWLEGEMENT: PATAKA that an understanding of the determination behind this survival is the key to understanding New Zealand society. He spoke of the distinctive markers of New Zealand identity through our people and their ability to embrace global and local culture.

#### Museum miscellany

Day Two saw a move away from the conference theme; the only times this was firstly addressed was by Charles Callis during his talk about creating and taking taonga to the Olympic Games, and secondly by Roger Mulvay in his discussion of developments at the Hawkes Bay Cultural Trust with regard to care and storage of taonga, a new cultural centre and development of the Trust as an expression of cultural evolution. The other speakers in the "What's New" segment gave engaging summaries of what was happening within their respective institutions - the Percy Thomson Gallery in Stratford and the Early Settlers Museum in Waipawa, but the theme could have been better continued in this forum. In a similar way, while the parallel session options catered for many elements of the sector - collection management, management, marketing - these did not reflect the conference theme. This may be a consequence of a more commercial side to the conference - three workshop leaders were from companies. Feedback from the NZ Micrographics and Futureworks workshops indicated practical content about what to ask companies when commissioning work. The progress report from the Transition Training Group mainly comprised a commercial presentation by the Aviation, Tourism and Travel Training Organisation (ATTTO), who have developed a new partnership with the sector for work-based training.

#### Special interest groups

The interest groups were especially valuable to people new to the industry or attending their first

conference, although session participants generally agreed that they could have benefited from stronger leadership and a specific agenda. The MEANZ group concentrated mainly on the Carter Observatory, the Curators group held a general discussion of issues, and the Registrars' group discussed the formation of a professional body to represent them within the industry. If these groups had been aligned with the conference theme, they could usefully have explored museum responses to issues relating to cultural evolution for bicultural institutions in the 21st century, covering issues such as bicultural collection management practice.

#### Practicalities

In general the conference was well organised. Inevitably time over-ran on Day One, particularly since two keynote speakers replaced John Tamihere. Each keynote session was followed by Panel/Open Discussions, which somehow added only limited value to the topics that had been presented. The panel chairs seemed to have difficulty encouraging or engaging discussion among the panels or the delegates. The conference theme was elusive outside the formal sessions; during networking opportunities the issues that had been presented were barely discussed.

#### **Final thoughts**

Was the Museums Aotearoa Conference *Cultural Evolution in New Zealand* worthwhile? As a networking and thought-provoking forum for museum professionals, it remains a worthwhile event in the industry calendar. However, as the profession grows in number and develops in identity, future conference organisers should be mindful that attendance represents a significant cost outlay to smaller institutions' budgets. All delegates want to come away with ideas and practical skills that are going to propel the industry forward as a united and bicultural sector in the future.

This was Liz Cotton's first museum conference. She is Registrar at the Waikato Coalfields Museum in Huntly and was recently awarded her Diploma in Museum Studies from Massey University with Distinction. Prior to working at the Waikato Coalfields Museum, she was employed at the University of Auckland and the British Museum in London.



Phone 09 828 5206 / 0800 830 500 • models@purfex.com • www.purfex.com We can customise our mannequins to suit your display needs • Re-size • Re-cover • Repaint

# museums

aotearoa

A Strategy for the Museum Sector in New Zealand

is available from Museums Aotearoa P.O. Box 10-928, Wellington or email: mail@museums-aotearoa.org.nz

The cost is \$10 plus GST per copy. There is a discount for Museums Aotearoa members.

